

Serving Children in the Digital Future

Questions

1. Do you agree with our view that a dedicated service for Children will enhance the public service offering in the Welsh language for Children?
2. Do you believe that a third party provider would be willing to provide a Welsh language television service for Children of a similar nature to that outlined above on a commercial basis?
3. Can you identify any other stakeholders we should be contacting not included at Annex A?
4. Do you have any comments / what are your views about the proposed hours of broadcast and our target audiences?
5. What would you consider to be the most important key characteristics for television services for Children provided by S4C?
6. Do you have any comments on the options set out at paragraph 4 and in particular the option 1 and 2? Do you have any other comments you would like us to consider on this issue?
7. Do you have any other comments you would like us to consider in relation to this Consultation on a new Welsh language television channel for Children?

Responses S - W

Name Ruth Sanders

Q1 Yes

Q2 Yes

Q3 No

Q4 Be good to have programmes during the day that can be used as part of lesson - there are hardly any teenage type videos for learners apart from Pam Fi Duw? (which we no longer use)

Q5 Relevant to everyday life, accessible hours, programmes linked to websites, variety of north and south Wales dialects

Q6 No comment

Q7 Definitely must have programmes for Welsh learners - our pupils are encouraged to watch S4C but they only ever seem to watch Pobol y Cwm with the subtitles. Lots of other programmes the actors and presenters talk too fast and the pupils switch off and never try again. If we want the Welsh language to develop then we must meet the needs of 2nd language learners

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Ifana Savill

Q1 Yes.

Q2 Yes.

Q3 No

- Q4 Programmes needed for the youngest children when they come home from school i.e. before Planed Plant. Schools need to be able to watch Planed Plant Bach- current scheduling inconvenient for them. Many people have told me this.
- Q5 Family viewing is needed, to bridge between children and adults. Now that Pobl y Cwm is much "harder" the channel has nothing like that. "Rownd a Rownd" is the closest thing but something lighter is needed e.g. Mr Bean
- Q6 More drama for children. More connection with books. "Darllen 'Da Fi" is excellent. Introducing the best to small children.
- Q7 A balance is needed between originations and acquisitions, especially for the younger children. Not too much animation. Children need to have a sense of ownership of the channel.

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Heather Simpson

- Q1 Yes. Children of school age need to know that Welsh is normal for all aspects of life and they miss the programmes once in school
- Q2 No. not sure if there are enough Welsh speaking companies to spend the money on adverts
- Q3 No. can't think of any you've missed
- Q4 Important to have programmes for small children (4-7) available from 3:30 till about 4:30 and then older children (7-12) after that.
- Q5 Good quality as is planed plant Bach now.
- Q6 Need programmes for children (4-7) on before 6pm as most will not be watching after this time. they need it to be every day or they will just watch another channel that is the same every day. You could make time on S4c for this as older children and adults would be able to understand changes to timetables
- Q7 It should help the development of the language in young people as they grow up.

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Sian Teagle

- Q1 Yes. My children feel sad when there are no Welsh language programmes on television. Programmes that are suitable for them are not shown after school or before school. Having a range of programmes, suitable for a range of age groups, such as Cbeebies, CBBC etc would be great. It is sad that the Welsh language is lagging behind once again!!
- Q2 Yes
- Q3 No
- Q4 The current broadcasting timetable is not suitable for children. Programmes for small children are shown at lunchtime, when they are at school or having lunch!
- Q5 Unfortunately, I have to say that the Welsh should learn from the English - their Cbeebies, CBBCetc would be great if they were available in Welsh.
- Q6 No comment
- Q7 There are many young people interested in working in the media. It would be nice to see new faces, not the same ones over and over again. Or even bringing some of the old presenters back. Also,

South Walian also speak Welsh, but all presenters sound as if they come from North Wales!!!

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Elly Thomas

- Q1 Yes
- Q2 I don't know. It depends on the number of potential viewers. As Welsh is still a minority language in Wales, how many companies would choose to advertise on it? I am not well enough informed to comment.
- Q3 No
- Q4 I think that your proposal is excellent. I would prefer my children (4 and 16 months) to watch Welsh language television programmes but being of an age where they only like cartoons find there is not a lot on offer for them.
- Q5 For teenagers to be involved in the process. Adults impressions of what teenagers find interesting is often way off the mark!
- Q6 No comment
- Q7 No comment

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Meinir Thomas

- Q1 Yes. Considering the amount of English language provision, a block of programmes in Welsh rather than an hour here and there would increase profile and competition. As well as viewing at home, it would also be a useful educational tool for Welsh medium schools, which have a high percentage of children from non-Welsh speaking homes.
- Q2 Yes.
- Q3 No
- Q4 As a mother of children under the age of 3, my interest lies primarily in programmes for the youngest children. Totally agree with broadcasting from early on in the morning. I would also suggest a few hours at the end of the afternoon, straight after school. Planed Plant Bach currently shown at an inappropriate time (lunch time). Ideal to have programmes during school holidays (first thing in the morning). Good idea to have Planed Plant immediately following Planed Plant Bach, so that the younger children are aware that there is continuity. What about a programme like Uned 5 on Saturday mornings?
- Q5 High production values. Variety e.g. animation and presenters. Fluent Welsh so that the programmes set a standard for first language Welsh speakers and learners.
- Q6 If a future audience is to be secure, I would recommend that as many hours as possible are broadcast.
- Q7 No comment

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Richard Thomas

- Q1 Yes
- Q2 No. it might be possible to have these services provided with a large advertising content, but this would not be my favoured model. My children predominantly watch CBeebies at the moment, and

its lack of advertising is one of the reasons I do not discourage this.

- Q3 No comment
- Q4 Providing programming for pre-school children from 7-9 am, possibly 12.30- 2pm and early afternoon, say 3.30- 6pm on a weekdays would be a minimum for this group. it might be possible to combine these programming hours with somewhat condensed coverage of WAG business [although I personally question the relevance to me of covering WAG business]. I accept what you say about viewing for pre-teens and teens needing to be provided separately and would support this. While it be possible to provide programmes for teenagers after 6pm on the channel which had previously been showing content for pre-school children, this would still leave a shortage of provision at weekends when all three groups are likely to want to watch some television
- Q5 Longer hours of provision, with a clearly defined platform and timing; relevant programming covering issues important to them. I would probably also like there to be some programming around sport and outside activities to stimulate and maintain interest in these areas [because I am concerned that the physical activity levels of the population are falling, weight is increasing and this is detrimental to health]
- Q6 I prefer option 1
- Q7 None, other than that I think it is a very good idea to increase programme provision for children. I am sure that the fact that my 4 year old and 3 year old are able to turn on the television and watch programmes in English at almost any time encourages them to use English rather than Welsh. I am sure that longer hours of provision of Welsh Language services would see an increase in their acceptance and use of the Welsh language. While I am far from fluent I speak Welsh to my children and have replies in English, but the same happens in the families of other friends who are fluent. The Welsh language culture for children on television will always be less than English provision but more programming in Welsh will help address some of that.

· - · - · - · - · - · - ·

Name Thomas

- Q1 Yes
- Q2 Yes
- Q3 No comment
- Q4 No comment
- Q5 No comment
- Q6 No comment
- Q7 No comment

· - · - · - · - · - · - ·

Name Branwen Thomas

- Q1 Yes. We need many Welsh language resources of high standard to create a natural follow-on from Planed Plant Bach and Planed Plant etc.
- Q2 No comment
- Q3 No comment
- Q4 My son is 6½. It would be ideal to have Welsh language programmes between 07.00 - 09.00 when he gets up on Saturdays and Sundays, as already happens during holiday periods. Currently he

watches Toodatik on ITV.

- Q5 It would have to be of a high standard, and be able to compare favourably, if not better, with provision on commercial channels that broadcast while children's S4C is off the air.
- Q6 Option 1 is better than 2 because the Assembly only sits (for some reason) during school terms. If this were to change in the future, the situation would have to be reviewed.
- Q7 I don't believe that a 24/7 television service should be available for children because that makes them over-dependent on the television, and impairs development in other areas. A weekend service for all age groups of a standard comparable with other services, in other languages, would be good.

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Ian Titherington

- Q1 Yes
- Q2 Yes
- Q3 Yes
- Q4 There is no evidence in your proposals that parents of pre-school children have been adequately consulted.
- Q5 The timing and reliability of the time slot
- Q6 No comment
- Q7 My son is 18 months old and will be receiving Welsh medium education and he attends a full time English medium nursery as there is no Welsh medium equivalent in the vicinity. When we watch TV with him, we have no Welsh medium option due to us both working full-time. Therefore, the times when we have the opportunity to read books or watch TV with him are from 7am-8.30am and from 5.30pm to 7pm (or generally short periods within these time slots).

Presently, he watches CBeebies (to avoid adverts) and we were excited about the prospect of having the choice of Planet Plant Bach at least for one or the other of the morning or evening periods for full time working parents. Yet, you do not appear to be allowing for this which for pre-school children, appears a little odd. I would therefore be grateful if you explain the thinking behind the planning for pre-school children.

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Penri Williams

- Q1 Yes. It is important to provide a wide range of programmes for children throughout the day.
- Q2 No. S4C has a wealth of experience of working with its partners.
- Q3 No
- Q4 There is huge competition for children's attention throughout the day. The Welsh language must have the same service as that provided for children in English by the BBC and other bodies.
- Q5 Must be lively and appealing to attract the attention of children, and keep their interest. Encourages them to speak Welsh.
- Q6 The BBC should provide space to broadcast the Assembly, thus releasing S4. Option 2 is the most practical. Children's attention must be caught from the minute they come home from school (around 3 o'clock) and in the morning from 7 o'clock and during weekends. .

Q7 No comment

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Wendy Williams

Q1 Yes

Q2 No

Q3 No

Q4 Maybe cut down on the hours broadcast from the Assembly, so that a wider choice of programmes is available to nursery children and older children. Maybe produce an entertaining programme for young people about the Assembly, in order to increase their interest in, and awareness of, political matters etc.

Q5 Produce a variety of programmes, educational and encouraging the use of Welsh in all aspects of life. Also produce a programme for children (of all ages) who are learning Welsh - aimed specifically at learners.

Q6 No comment

Q7 No comment

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name T J Williams

Q1 Yes. A much wider choice of Welsh language programmes for all ages is much needed. The programmes in English (USA and UK) are mostly of a low quality, paying no heed to the effects they may be having on individuals.

Q2 Yes. If of good enough quality you could sell the programmes abroad to increase the budget.

Q3 Yes. Expand the broadcast industry and create work, gives children a creative boost in sports, arts etc. Shows how to fulfil children's ambitions.

Q4 Will be an opportunity to be more flexible with content for different ages.

Q5 see earlier.

Q6 No

Q7 No

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Vivian Parry Williams

Q1 Yes. As there is so much provision in English for children, it is crucial to have a comparable service for Welsh speaking children. As a grandfather of five children, aged between 2 and 10, I know of the effect that English language cartoons etc have on my grandchildren. While the few hours of Welsh language output currently available is very welcome, the wide choice available in English leads to a situation where children more often than not end up watching the English language programmes. I hope we will soon see a block of provision for our children, as is already available to children in the rest of the UK.

Q2 Yes. I don't mind if it is the Man in the Moon who provides a service of this sort, as long as the necessary funding is available to provide programmes that will appeal to Wales' children and young people.

- Q3 No. Which Annex A?
- Q4 As already mentioned it is nowhere near enough to compete with other similar channels.
- Q5 Ensure that Welsh children will not have to turn to the multitude of programmes available on other channels.
- Q6 Option 2, without a doubt! In my opinion, very few people in Wales are interested in the discussions held in the National Assembly. That channel is currently completely wasted.
- Q7 Whoever funds the service, it needs to be done soon, if my experience of my grandchildren's television choices is anything to go by. Children brought up in completely Welsh speaking homes have their language polluted by Anglo-American sayings. I hope to see a service comprising totally of acceptable Welsh, broadcasting to present and future Welsh children and young people, starting soon.

· - · - · - · - · - · - ·

Name Paul Williams

- Q1 Yes. But as a family we are very concerned and frustrated that you use terms like "a mainly Welsh language service" and " a significant proportion of programming will be original home-grown programming produced in Wales". What on earth does this mean? As you mention, there is already a huge choice of channels and English language programmes and, believe me, our children will choose to stay with their favourites on Boomerang, Tiny Pop and Nick Junior etc. if S4 does not provide Welsh language entertainment for them. And we will not necessarily encourage them to turn to S4 if the provision is some mix of bilingual or English language programming for parts of the day. Please please do not be tempted by the curse of bilingualism. That has always annoyed me on S4C broadcasts from the Assembly - the English translation would always CUT ACROSS any AM who had the temerity to speak in Welsh in the Senedd....aaaaaaach!

Anyway, in these days of red button technology, subtitles or translations are possible, but please keep the new service in Welsh only

- Q2 Yes. I clicked on YES above by mistake and was unable to undo. In fact, I have no opinion on the matter.
- Q3 No comment
- Q4 I guess the hours are reasonable when we consider budgetary restraints.

While pleased to see your intention of broadcasting a significant proportion of "...original home-grown programming", I see nothing wrong with repeating old programmes (within reason, and with long gaps between repeats!). I am sure that many excellent programmes are held in archives, so why not take advantage of some of the best of these for all ages? This could be marketed as an opportunity for parents to introduce their children to their childhood favourites. It would also save on expenditure. Otherwise, why not consider making old programmes available through the red button as an additional service? Having said this, the ridiculous practice on S4C Digital of broadcasting most programmes several times a week must be avoided.

I am not quite sure what 'original' means, but dubbed cartoons such as Tair Slic and Clwb Winx, and Ffi-ffi etc. have been among the most popular programmes on S4C in our house recently.

- Q5 Avoid broadcasting English language or bilingual programmes.
- Q6 As a family we favour Option 2, head and shoulders above the others. If a choice has to be made between broadcasting for children and broadcasting the ramblings of politicians, then the children should win.

But what about this as an improvement on Option 2 - broadcasting an uninterrupted children's

service 7 days per week, while broadcasting highlights of Assembly proceedings after 9pm on the relevant days, when the channel would be empty otherwise. And on the days that the Assembly does not sit, show S4C's many repeats, thus releasing S4C Digital to show something of value and interest!

Q7 About time you considered a channel for children. Thank you for the opportunity to voice an opinion, and good wishes with the plan.

· - · - · - · - · - · - ·

Name Gareth Williams

Q1 Yes. A more competitive Welsh language service is needed to compete with English language digital channels. The current service is too patchy. It would be nice to be able to choose from a constant stream of children's programmes that can be watched at any time of the day.

Q2 Yes

Q3 No

Q4 Agree with the proposed pattern of scheduling, 6.00am until 9.00pm

Q5 A variety of interesting programmes including cartoons, educational programmes, news, quizzes, entertainment formats, music, documentaries about Wales, environment, arts and crafts, cookery, sport...the possibilities are endless...Too many repeats must be avoided. Fresh, lively, new presenters. Prove that a high quality 15 hour per day service through the medium of WELSH is possible. Ensure a high standard of spoken Welsh by presenters. A substantial investment must be made in the channel to ensure its success!

Q6 Isn't it more important to get children interested in the channel and the language than to show boring programmes from the assembly? Mixing the two would be a mistake. Is there no way of acquiring a third channel for Assembly coverage and news or to include a 30 minute Assembly programme on S4C1 on Sunday afternoons?

Q7 I am sure that parents, children and schools would be extremely pleased to have the exciting service proposed. The sooner, the better!

· - · - · - · - · - · - ·

Name Iona Williams

Q1 Yes

Q2 No

Q3 No comment

Q4 It will be great to have children's TV on for longer (especially preschool and older children)

Q5 No comment

Q6 Can the assembly coverage not be provided by use of the red button?

Q7 No comment

· - · - · - · - · - · - ·

Name Mererid Mair Williams

Q1 Yes. More children's programming in Welsh is needed. Children can watch Cbeebies and CBBC all day but Planed Plant Bach and planed plant are on the air for only a few hours. It would be good to have provision throughout the day - not that they necessarily can watch all day - but that the option

of watching Welsh language programmes is available all day.

- Q2 Yes
- Q3 No
- Q4 These hours would be acceptable
- Q5 Good quality programmes. Some educational but some pure entertainment! A balance should be struck between north and south Wales.
- Q6 It would be a pity to lose the broadcasts from the Assembly - but is the children's audience bigger, therefore making a children's channel more sensible and keeping programmes from the assembly and eisteddfodau etc on S4?
- Q7 No comment

· - · - · - · - · - · - ·

Name Lisa Williams

- Q1 Yes
- Q2 No. Not sure - don't know any potential providers in the field. Keen not to follow a commercial route as some of the English language providers.
- Q3 Papurau Bro? (Welsh language community newspapers)
- Q4 Good on the whole but I would like to see more nursery aged programmes after 15.00 because a number of under 5s finish school around 15.00-15.30. After they come home from school there is nothing available for them in Welsh at the moment. It would be better if there was something until at least 18.00.
- Q5 Any increase in broadcast hours for nursery children would be better than current provision to be honest. Many children who live in Education Authority areas that start schooling at 3 years old, such as RCT, are missing out because Planed Plant Bach is only shown at lunch time. If parents don't buy Welsh language DVDs, they have to watch Cbeebies/Nick Jr etc before and after school. Not everyone has SKY Plus/ or the means to record programmes. Saturday afternoon is the only opportunity some nursery children currently get to watch Welsh language programmes and many families tend to go out at weekends unfortunately. Having some programmes at 7am during school holidays is a blessing. I never understand why this is not possible during the term as well? In my opinion, therefore, nursery programmes between 6.00 a 9.00am, an hour sometime around lunch time as it currently is and in the afternoon between 15.30-18.00. Then every child under 5 will be able to watch at least some Welsh language programmes.
- Q6 Option 2 without a doubt. How many people really watch the Assembly programmes? So boring! Especially after the recent fiasco! There is enough politics on the news/ in the papers. Programmes for children are much more important. Think of the viewing figures - which service would be have the bigger audience? Children watching their channel or adults watching the Assembly? Option 1 would not work in my opinion - how could you explain to a young child that his/ her favourite programme is not on for three days because political matters are taking precedence?
- Q7 The children of Wales are the future of our country and language. It is a duty on us to provide a more comprehensive service and build on the success of Planed Plant Bach and Planed Plant, in order to ensure that every child in the country has the same opportunity to watch quality programmes in Welsh in the mornings, afternoons and evenings.

· - · - · - · - · - · - ·

Name Manon Fflur Williams

Q1. Yes. This service/ block for teenagers is COMPLETELY ESSENTIAL in my opinion, if we are to enrich the media experience of our young Welsh speakers. I have felt the need for this service since digital became available! There is so much competition from the other channels that is now a 'must', not a choice. Get on with it, really! I would like to see it all in place before my two daughters reach their teenage years.

Q2. No comment

Q3. (Do you mean another audience that could benefit from a dedicated television service) If you do - far more television hours for primary aged children could be of benefit to them too, but I realise priorities must be set because of budget restraints!

QQ4. Ideally....!!! Broadcasting for pre-school children between 7am and 3pm (I know from talking to a number of other parents that they cannot live without CBEEBIES!! - and that one hour of Planed Plant Bach - although that hour is fantastic - is not sufficient by any means! I hear much praise for that hour between 12.30 - 1.30)
Broadcasting for primary aged children between 3 and 5pm
Broadcasting for secondary children, years 7 - 9 between 5 and 7pm
Broadcasting for secondary pupils, years 10 - 13 between 7 - 9pm
(Of course, parents don't want their children to watch TOO MUCH television! - but by broadcasting all these hours - FLEXIBILITY TO CHOOSE VIEWING HOURS would be given to parents/ young people. This is the biggest benefit the channel would offer).

5. FUN! FUN! FUN!
Enjoyment through the medium of Welsh with no education programmes! (Unless it is presented in a fun way so that the children are almost unaware that it is educational) The odd documentary/ factual/ journalistic programme for the older children would be acceptable, but the emphasis must always be on entertainment if you want to keep people of this age watching! They have enough lessons all day in school! They will want to relax in the evenings! They will turn to another channel if the provision isn't contemporary, containing things they can 'really relate' to.

It would be worth investing in serious research before establishing the older children's service especially, in order to find out what issues really deserve their place in their 'slot'. Losing that target audience would be a loss to the language!

I also feel that there is a need for a programme aimed at teenage Welsh learners. This audience must be provided for in a very appealing way, without losing the first language audience! (sub-titles! - or maybe something like a soap opera featuring learners and first language Welsh speakers? - maybe something like 'Welsh in a Week' - setting fun/ adventurous challenges' for teenagers rather than adults.

Q6. No comment

Q7. No comment

· - · - · - · - · - · - ·

Name Iwan Gwyn Williams

Q1 No comment

Q2 No comment

Q3 No comment

Q4 No comment

Q5 No comment

Q6 Although Assembly proceedings are interesting, priority should definitely be given to a Welsh

language channel for children and young people. If there is not enough funding for both - children should definitely be prioritised in my opinion. Broadcasts from the Assembly appeal to a narrow audience.

Q7 No comment

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Luned Williams

Q1 Yes

Q2 Yes

Q3 No

Q4 No comment

Q5 No comment

Q6 No comment

Q7 No comment

· _ · _ · _ · _ · _ · _ ·

Name Elin Wyn

Q1 Yes

Q2 Yes

Q3 No

Q4 No comment

Q5 No comment

Q6 I welcome S4C's decision to attempt to provide a channel for children and wish them well with this new venture. However, I am disappointed that the new service is suggested apparently at the expense of broadcasting from the Assembly, which is of utmost importance to citizenship in Wales. Paragraph 3.3 of the consultation document notes that broadcasting from the Assembly on S4C2 is not a public service. This is technically and legally correct. The channel was established as a commercial channel during summer 1999 in order to ensure that the service was launched by the time the National Assembly opened. But when we consider inherent features of public service there is no doubt that broadcasting from the Assembly on S4C2 is indeed public service. It is a service that the market would not provide and is a service that is provided for the public good and in order to support democracy.

In a booklet on parliamentary broadcasting in the Commonwealth Torben Krogh, Chair of UNESCO's International Communications Development Programme notes that parliamentary broadcasting should be the responsibility of public service broadcasters:
"Live parliamentary broadcasts... provide an opportunity for the constituents to appraise the conduct of their elected representatives. No doubt, that such appraisal by electors is essential to develop effective and accountable representation in democratic governance. It also ensures the right of the people to receive a diversity of viewpoints on important political issues and the freedom to seek information on matters that directly affects them. Parliamentary broadcasts therefore falls squarely within the remit of the public broadcaster".

Of the three options presented in the consultation document for Assembly broadcasting, it appears that only one is acceptable, namely Option 2. The document notes that Option 3 is not currently

possible and it was clearly stated in a public meeting I attended that Option 1 is not acceptable to the Authority either. I am mystified as to why no further options have been presented.

Paragraph 5 of the document commits to continued additional broadcasting from national events on the spare capacity on S4C2, either via the red button or on the "S4C2" channel. If it is therefore possible to continue to provide these services alongside the children's service, why is it not possible to provide a service from the Assembly, either via the red button or on S4C2, or even through the red button on S4C Digital? The Eisteddfodau and the Royal Welsh Show happen when the Assembly is in recess, so there would be no clash of priorities. The cost of purchasing broadcast space is a consideration, but as I understand it the broadcasting of the Urdd Eisteddfod, for example, would require more band width than the broadcasting of Assembly proceedings, because of more movement within the screen.

Option 3 mentions purchasing additional space for an uninterrupted children's service and that that is not possible without extra monies. Would it not be cheaper to pay for additional space for Assembly broadcasts? Currently the service is on air only three days per week, from 9am until 6pm, for around 35 weeks of the year. In terms of knowing how much broadcast space would need to be purchased for Assembly broadcasts, dates are set at least nine months in advance and generally coincide with school terms.

The crucial question is who would pay for this new space. Accepting that broadcasting parliamentary proceedings is public service (whatever is said in paragraph 3) and accepting that a public service broadcaster should be responsible for this broadcasting, it could be strongly argued that S4C and/ or BBC should pay for the space as part of their commitment to public service in Wales. Until summer 2005 BBC Wales and S4C were paying the Assembly (through the Assembly Broadcasting Company) for pictures and sound from Assembly proceedings. Since the Assembly decided to distribute pictures and sound for no charge to all broadcasters there has been a substantial saving for BBC and S4C. This money could be contributed to the cost of purchasing extra space, although another source of funding would probably be needed. I believe it would be a matter for S4C and/ or BBC and/ or DCMS to find this additional funding. It would be very unlikely that it would be viable for a commercial company to contribute to the cost of purchasing the space.

An argument has been made that the broadcasting landscape has been transformed since 1999 and that there is no longer a necessity to provide a service from the Assembly on a digital television channel. Web casting from the Assembly was not available in 1999, and although the service is now offered by the Assembly, the standard is not as high as it should be, compared with the webcasting from the Scottish Parliament, for example. Ending Assembly broadcasting on television would be a big step backwards and depending on web casting only would exclude people who cannot afford access to the web or the equipment needed to view the service.. Depending on web casting only, whoever provides it, would mean that citizens would have to pay to see their elected representatives at work in the Assembly - a service that should be available free of charge to all citizens.

In 1999 launching a bilingual broadcasting service from the Assembly on S4C2 was an innovative venture and some may argue that the venture has fulfilled its purpose. But I believe that ending broadcasting from the Assembly at this point in time would be a big mistake. As the Assembly has new legislative power there is increased interest in its work and it could be expected that more people will want to watch the proceedings on S4C2. Recently BBC Wales received over 350 suggestions for a measure to be presented at the Assembly. This is proof of the increasing interest in Welsh politics. With the new system of a Petitions Committee accepting suggestions for legislation from the public, it is easy to foresee many occasions when people will turn to S4C2 Assembly broadcasts for the first time to watch the progress of their measure. This is public service in its truest sense and one that should continue on television.

If countries like Uganda and Trinidad and Tobago can sustain live parliamentary television coverage, surely Wales, with two public service channels, can continue to maintain its Assembly broadcasting service.