



Basic Details

Consultation title: **Serving Children in the Digital Future**

To: Alun Thomas, Secretary, S4C

Name of respondent: **Keith W Jones**

Representing (self or organisation/s) / Job Title: **BBC**

Please state your age if you are 16 years old and under:

Address (if not received by email):

Confidentiality / Declaration

What do you want S4C to keep confidential?

Nothing

~~Name /Contact Details /Job Title /Age~~

~~Response~~

~~Organisation~~

If you want part of your response, your name or your organisation to be confidential, can S4C still publish a reference to the contents of your response (including, for any confidential parts, a general summary that does not disclose the specific information or enable you to be identified)? However, all responses will be shared with the Department of Culture, Media and Sport to inform the Secretary of State in the decision making on the New Service.

I confirm that the correspondence supplied with this cover sheet is a formal consultation response. It can be published (subject to that which I have noted to be kept confidential above) on S4C's website and shared with DCMS, unless otherwise specified on this cover sheet, and I authorise S4C and DCMS to make use of the information in this response to meet its legal requirements. If I have sent my response by email, S4C can disregard any standard e-mail text about not disclosing email contents and attachments.

Name - Keith W Jones

Signed (if hard copy)

S4C Authority Consultation Paper:

Serving Children in the Digital Future

BBC Consultation Response

Executive Summary

The BBC welcomes the opportunity to respond to the S4C Authority's consultation document and to participate in the important debate about the provision of Welsh language programming for children and teenagers.

The debate is timely with the imminent transition from analogue to digital television in Wales and the migration from traditional to new media forms of consumption.

After the BBC, S4C is now the second largest investor in original, UK produced content for children and teenagers. We believe that diversity of supply within the children's genres is to be welcomed. We also welcome the ambition to address the disparity of provision for these audiences in Welsh.

The BBC is proud of its creative and productive relationship with S4C that has served the channel well since its establishment in 1982. Both broadcasters have public service responsibilities and strong traditions in providing high-quality content to audiences in the Welsh language. This is as true in children's programmes as in other programme genre. The Strategic Partnership between the BBC and S4C underlines our commitments both to Welsh language audiences and to S4C.

In our response we have sought to address the specific questions asked in the consultation document and to expand on the some of the issues raised by the proposals and the options presented.

We recognise that it will be a matter for the S4C Authority to assess the value of the proposals and their impact on any existing or potential new services for audiences in Wales. In this document, we suggest ways in which the considerations might be balanced and how variants of the existing options might be achievable.

We have provided our own insights into these audiences and their rapidly changing behaviours in terms of media consumption (section 2). In section 3, we describe briefly the Strategic Partnership which provides the backcloth for the development of our own editorial ideas in the children's genre. Section 4 places the S4C2 Assembly Service in its historical context and describes the way in which coverage of Welsh politics has changed since 1999.

In section 5, we respond in detail to the S4C Authority's proposals for the new television service for children and the options that are under consideration. In doing so, we note that there are some areas where further clarity about the proposals would aid public debate, including:

- a) whether the Authority has considered alternative models of delivery (5.10)
- b) whether children's programming will remain on S4C Digidol and if so could it be extended (5.20)
- c) whether the hours between 6.00am – 12.30pm on S4C Digidol will be available for children's or political programming (5.23 – 5.26)

- d) the proposed new service's purposes and performance measures (5.6)
- e) production quotas and funding (5.9-2)
- f) whether some of the programming will be bilingual or in English (5.9-3)

Aside from the policy matters that the S4C Authority will need to consider, there are important issues concerning the capacity required to provide the proposed service on digital terrestrial television. In 5.13, we set out our understanding of the transmission requirements of the three options as presented in the consultation document.

It is currently planned that S4C's existing digital services – S4C Digidol and S4C2 - will move to BBC multiplex capacity, (Mux B) in Wales only, from the start of digital switchover in 2009. However, it must be noted that the capacity which would be made available for S4C2 is available only for the hours of the existing service. Outside those hours, the relevant capacity will be used by BBC services, and would not therefore be available for a new S4C children's service (5.17).

This clearly raises questions which the Authority will need to address in its consideration of whether to replace S4C2 with a children's service, in particular how any variation in the scheduling of the two alternative services could be accommodated on digital terrestrial.

In this regard we welcome the acknowledgement in the consultation document that other digital terrestrial capacity has been reserved for S4C to launch additional free-to-air Welsh language services. This suggests in itself that it could in practice be possible to continue to provide the S4C2 Assembly coverage service (in the capacity currently intended to be provided for it on the BBC multiplex), while launching a new children's service in capacity allocated direct to S4C. In any further consideration of the possible options, and in particular Option 3 (which would seek to continue to offer an Assembly coverage service in addition to a new children's channel) it would be useful to know what consideration the Authority may have given to such a scenario.

1. Introduction

- 1.1. In recent years with the growth of digital television, the increased availability of content on-demand and the blurring of boundaries between platforms, young audiences have been at the vanguard of change in the media landscape.
- 1.2. They are not old enough to remember a world without mobile phones, or life without the Internet, or television without remote control and a red button. They expect to be able to access what they want, when they want and wherever they want – scheduling is an old-fashioned concept.
- 1.3. This consultation is also timely with Ofcom’s review of the future of children’s programming and the recently enacted Strategic Partnership between the BBC and S4C which has at its heart the agreed common purpose of providing high quality public services to audiences in the Welsh language.

2. The Audiences

- 2.1. Both Ofcom and BBC research confirm the rapid change in the media consumption habits of these young audiences as described in the consultation document.
- 2.2. In its project overview, Ofcom points to the fact that children now have access to 18 dedicated children’s channels available on multi channel platforms – all of course in the English language. It is not surprising therefore that the S4C Authority concludes that *“at the moment, S4C is not the natural choice for a significant number of children”* in Wales.
- 2.3. BBC research in Wales and across the UK confirms these changing media consumption habits and the trend away from traditional TV viewing in favour of new media content and emerging platforms:

2.4. Who are they?

- There are around 600,000 children under 16 years of age in Wales (20% of the population).
- Of the 500,000 children aged 3 -15, 185,000 (38%) of them speak Welsh - an increase of 50% between 1991 and 2001. But for the majority, English is the language of the home – only a small proportion live in a wholly Welsh-speaking household.¹
- Their use of the Welsh language depends on a number of factors including whether their parents speak Welsh; whether Welsh is the language of the home; peer pressure; the use of Welsh in the community, their level of fluency and image – both their own and that of the language.
- Children in Wales are growing up in an increasingly ethnically diverse society.
- Children are an influential group, even though they don’t have much cash in hand. Three quarters of children receive pocket money or an allowance.

¹ Ref: www.bwrdd-yr-iaith.org.uk

2.5. Welsh language media in their lives²

- Generally, English language media are far more popular than Welsh; they rarely discuss Welsh language TV programmes with their friends; awareness of programmes is low and there are very few TV celebrities in Wales that they recognise. But, 'role models' who speak Welsh, such as Ioan Gruffudd and Rhys Ifans, are admired.
- Their favourite Welsh language television programmes are *Rownd a Rownd*, *Pobol y Cwm*, *Y Clwb Rygbi* and *Eisteddfod yr Urdd*.
- They also watch programmes such as *Doctor Who*, *Coronation Street*, *EastEnders*, *Britain's Got Talent*, *Champions League*, *Casualty* and *Big Brother* (a selection of their top recent series).
- Their viewing to other channels confirms the comment in the introduction to the consultation that S4C is not their channel of choice. They turn instead to CBBC on BBC1, CITV and the digital children's channels if they can.
- They want to know about the world outside Wales and their other interests are no different from their peers across the UK. Some are interested in news and watch the BBC's *Ffeil* on S4C (av. audience 10,000) but more of them watch *Newsround* on BBC One (av. audience in Wales 50,000).³
- Welsh speaking teenagers use the internet for messaging, search and social networking and nearly all of their mobile and online activity is in English. Very little of the texting and messaging is in Welsh - if anything, it is in 'Wenglish'.

2.6. Television, New Media and Radio in their lives

- Children have substantial control over their own viewing habits. More than half of primary school-aged children have TV sets in their bedrooms. The proportion of children with DVDs, PCs and games consoles has also risen.
- Children's TV choices today are very broad. They live in a multi-channel world that offers them something to watch whatever the time of the day. Around half of their viewing is to multi-channels.
- They watch TV as they get ready for school. Easy to watch programmes work best during the morning rush.
- However, the impact of other media on children's TV is now clearly visible - their TV viewing is decreasing year by year.
- Just over 7 in 10 children aged 5-16 can connect to the internet at home, via either a computer, a games console or a television. Online games are the most popular leisure activity.
- Mobile phones are very popular. Amongst 11-16 year olds, 9 out of 10 children are phone owners.

² BARB data and BBC market research

³ Total audience, all ages

- Children tend to listen to mainstream pop music stations (e.g., Radio 1). They rarely listen to speech-based radio stations. Listening by an analogue radio is by far the most popular way of 'tuning in'.
 - Overall four in five children say they listen to the radio (79%) especially older children.
- 2.7. Further detail and the BBC's latest market research on children's audiences is available at www.bbc.co.uk/commissioning/marketresearch/

3. The BBC's Strategic Partnership with S4C

- 3.1. The Strategic Partnership Agreement between the BBC and S4C was announced on 17th October 2006. It covers the BBC's contribution of programmes and services to S4C between January 2007 and December 2009.
- 3.2. The BBC proposed the Strategic Partnership approach in order to set out clearly our commitment to Welsh language television and our continued support for S4C.
- 3.3. The Agreement recognises the responsibilities and traditions of both organisations in providing high-quality public services to audiences in the Welsh language and provides a robust framework for the joint development of linear and non-linear content.
- 3.4. Further, it sets out how we will strengthen and extend our contribution to S4C over the three year period as S4C implements its programme strategy in the run-up to digital switchover in Wales in 2009.
- 3.5. The Agreement contains an Editorial Planning Framework that sets out the processes by which the annual programme plan is agreed.
- 3.6. In addition, the BBC Trust's remit to BBC Wales is that our programming on S4C should: *".. exhibit some or all of the following characteristics: high production values, original, challenging, innovative and engaging content. It should also nurture Welsh talent both on and off screen."*
- 3.7. By building on established strengths and taking advantage of BBC wide skills in production and technological innovation, our aim is to make an emphatic contribution to S4C schedules with programmes of distinction, quality and excellence.
- 3.8. Since the establishment of S4C in 1982, the BBC has supplied the channel with at least 520 hours per annum of programmes, free of charge and funded by the licence fee.
- 3.9. Already, under the new Agreement and with the additional investment, our total supply of programmes to S4C will be around 620 hours in 2007/08.
- 3.10. It should be noted that this Contributed Programming does not include the broadcasts of the proceedings of the National Assembly for Wales. This is the subject of a separate arrangement as described in detail in section 4.

- 3.11. The most highly rated genres on S4C are rural programmes, sport (rugby and football), drama, cultural entertainment, national events, news & current affairs and children's output. In each of these over the years, BBC Wales has supplied varying proportions of the total genre hours on S4C. Schools programming has also been a consistent element in the mix.
- 3.12. However, the delivery of a rich and varied Welsh language television schedule is not the BBC's responsibility - that is the responsibility of the broadcaster. We believe that the most valuable contribution the BBC can make to S4C is to use our resources and the talents of our staff - their editorial and production skills, their technical and operational expertise and their innovations in new media - to underpin the Welsh language television service.
- 3.13. Hence, in line with the BBC Trust's remit to BBC Wales, our programme strategy in Welsh language television prioritises genres in order to both support S4C's editorial objectives and serve the BBC's public purposes.
- 3.14. Those public purposes as set out in the BBC's Charter are:
- Sustaining citizenship and civil society
 - Stimulating creativity and cultural excellence
 - Representing the UK, its nations, regions and communities
 - Promoting education and learning
 - Bringing the UK to the world and the world to the UK
 - Helping to deliver to the public the benefit of emerging communications technologies and services
- 3.15. In addition, the BBC Trust requires that:
- our contributed programming to S4C will have at its core, the obligation to provide audiences with accurate, impartial and independent daily news and programmes that document civic and political life in Wales and beyond.
 - the non-news output will reflect contemporary and historical life and culture in Wales. Welsh sport, including coverage of national sporting events, should be part of the programme mix.
 - BBC Wales will continue to provide children's news (as in the current daily bulletin *Ffeil*). In addition, we will develop other educative programming for children and teenagers within the resources allocated.
- 3.16. Prior to this consultation, the children's genre was one specific area identified by BBC Wales as a priority within our programme strategy in order to extend the reach of our Welsh language television output and to contribute to S4C's plans to provide a regular service for children between 4.00pm – 7.00pm.
- 3.17. Whilst the range and diversity of this schedule is of course S4C's responsibility, we have been proactive in proposing a substantial programme response that will contribute to achieving S4C's aims.

- 3.18. For a number of years we have been evolving our programming for children from curriculum focussed educational output to more entertaining educative formats with wider appeal such as *Ffeil* and the current *Bobinogi* and *Camp y Fan* strands.
- 3.19. *Bobinogi*, was designed to encourage learning amongst children aged five and under. The philosophy is of 'learning through play' for pre-school Welsh speaking children and for those children whose parents want them to learn the language.
- 3.20. *Camp y Fan*'s emphasis is on encouraging participation, developing thinking skills and 'learning through fun'.
- 3.21. For nearly a decade, *Ffeil* has succeeded in presenting news and current affairs to children and in so doing has introduced them to the grammar and conventions of journalism and reporting through the medium of Welsh. It has gained an international reputation within the EBU for its production values and its engagement with the target audience. The programme currently broadcasts daily in a 5 minute slot at the end of S4C's children's hour between 4.00pm - 5.00pm.
- 3.22. As part of the Editorial Planning Framework we have proposed and agreed with S4C the inclusion of a new magazine programme for a teenage audience in our annual supply. Funded and produced by BBC Wales within existing resources, it is currently planned to broadcast the programmes live, initially twice a week, from November 2007.
- 3.23. These plans are in line with S4C's Programme Policy Statement 2007 which noted – *"In the meantime, we will continue to extend our provision for children and will concentrate during 2007, on the 10-15 year age group."*
- 3.24. Our aim is to provide distinctive and entertaining programmes within a format that will encourage engagement, allow teenagers to share their experiences, ideas and concerns and inspire them to find out more about existing interests or develop new ones.
- 3.25. In BBC Wales we have close working relationships with colleagues in CBeebies, CBBC, Teens, New Media etc with whom we share insights and ideas to support the programme making process. These valuable links enable us to take advantage of BBC wide skills in production and technological innovation.
- 3.26. Additionally, we plan to build on the success of our Welsh language online sites for children by integrating online and on-air content through interactivity - connecting with the audience via texts, messaging or direct contact through broadband or mobile devices in a safe environment.
- 3.27. With the Strategic Partnership in place and these plans in train, the BBC therefore welcomes and supports S4C's ambition to provide dedicated programming for these audiences in the pre-school age group, older children and teenagers.

4. Coverage of Politics in Wales

The S4C2 Assembly Service

- 4.1. The consultation document makes brief reference to the coverage of the proceedings of the National Assembly for Wales, currently broadcast on S4C2.

Background

- 4.2. The service consists of live transmissions of the Assembly's plenary sessions together with live or recorded coverage of selected committees and briefings. It is paid for and produced by BBC Wales.
- 4.3. It is a service that was made possible in 1999 by the availability of new digital capacity provided by S4C on the SDN terrestrial multiplex, digital satellite and digital cable. Such capacity, as is the case today, was not available elsewhere.
- 4.4. For the BBC it was a partnership opportunity that presented an additional outlet for coverage of Welsh politics. We understood at the time that S4C also saw the same public value in this unique arrangement.
- 4.5. The BBC offered to fund and produce the output as part of our overall response to devolution in Wales, Scotland and Northern Ireland as announced by the BBC Governors in December 1998.
- 4.6. The arrangement was structured as a joint editorial relationship between the BBC and S4C through its wholly owned subsidiary S4C2 Cyf – the carriage to be delivered by the latter with BBC Wales providing the journalistic, editorial and production talent.
- 4.7. The service was granted its ITC licence on 23rd July, 1999 and started broadcasting on 14th September that year. Since January 2001, the service has also been available to Peers and MPs on the Westminster ring-main.
- 4.8. The service on S4C2 is bilingual and reflects the protocol and language policy of the National Assembly. Proceedings on the floor are conducted in both Welsh and English and a simultaneous translation is provided for any contributions in Welsh. The viewer can choose the translator's soundtrack to follow the politicians who address the Assembly in Welsh.
- 4.9. In addition to this element of the BBC's programming response to devolution, our other commitments included the creation of a new political reporting unit within BBC Wales; a twice weekly television programme (including First Minister's questions) on BBC 2 Wales; daily reporting and weekly programming on Radio Wales and Radio Cymru; additional weekly output for S4C; live coverage of ceremonial occasions; extended current affairs coverage and a strengthened newsgathering team including more specialist correspondents and regionally based reporters.
- 4.10. The BBC also committed to provide a new Welsh news online service including a site dedicated to Welsh politics.
- 4.11. Since the first elections to the National Assembly in May 1999, the total hours of political programming produced by BBC Wales on television and radio has increased from 119 hours in 1998 to 1,143 hours in 2007. That represents more than a nine-fold increase in nine years.

- 4.12. Of course, politics continues to be covered extensively in our news and current affairs output, with an average of between 10% and 15% of the stories on news programmes being political topics. During this year's Assembly election campaign, that figure rose to 40% in a typical week across the output.
- 4.13. There has been a huge increase in the number of hours produced by Radio Wales News. This increase – around 18 hours per week – has led to a significantly expanded Assembly coverage.
- 4.14. The development of News Online and Newyddion Arlein (services which barely existed in 1999) means that the reach and depth of BBC Wales's Assembly coverage is far superior to that which existed in 1999.
- 4.15. The online services now include audio and video clips of Assembly politicians and new innovations such as blogs by our Political and Welsh Affairs Editors.
- 4.16. Appendix B provides a breakdown of BBC Wales's political coverage pre and post devolution along with a list of our current political programmes and content.

Other provision

- 4.17. BBC Parliament is the BBC's public service channel providing comprehensive coverage of parliamentary proceedings. Its service licence remit from the BBC Trust is *"to make accessible to all, the work of the UK's parliamentary chambers and the European Parliament"*. One of the conditions is to *"Broadcast at least 100 hours of proceedings of the Welsh Assembly each year"* – the same as the Scottish Parliament.
- 4.18. For comparison, in Scotland, the BBC does not have access to capacity on which to broadcast a similar service from the Scottish Parliament. Holyrood TV, the Scottish Parliament's online channel, offers live streams of plenary and committee proceedings. It is not available on digital satellite, DTT or D-cable.
- 4.19. Also, the National Assembly itself broadcasts its proceedings (both plenary and committee meetings) online as a free service available at http://www.webcasting.wales.gov.uk/live_webcast_e.asp#.

The schedule on S4C2

- 4.20. Currently on S4C2, the BBC provides coverage of National Assembly proceedings every Tuesday, Wednesday and Thursday between 9.00am and 6.00pm.
- 4.21. Each plenary session in the Siambur is broadcast as well as most committee meetings. Proceedings are shown with little or no editorial mediation such as commentary or voice-over. On-screen text is used as a non-interventionist way of providing explanation and the bilingual information explains the background and context of the day's debates.
- 4.22. Live inserts at the start and close of transmission are used to analyse the day's political events in the Assembly with BBC correspondents.

4.23. The broadcasting schedule for the forthcoming session will be (approximately) as follows:

Tuesdays

9.00am - 1.00pm	Committees	(Recorded – not previously broadcast)
1.45pm - 5.30pm	Plenary	(Live - with First Minister's Questions)

Wednesdays

9.00am - 11.30am	Committees	(Live - key committee of the day)
12.30pm - 5.30pm	Plenary	(Live – including Ministerial Questions)

Thursdays

9.30am - 12.30pm	Committees	(Live – key committee of the morning)
2.00pm - 5.30pm	Committees	(Live – key committee of the afternoon)

Public Value of the S4C2 Assembly service

- 4.24. The consultation document states (3.3) that - *"The Assembly service on S4C2 is not a public service channel and there is no legal requirement on us to fund or provide this service."* Of course, there is no obligation on S4C to provide a children's service either and it will be a matter for the S4C Authority to make a judgement on the relative merits of providing one service or the other, or both.
- 4.25. Although not formally designated a public service channel, the arrangement with the BBC in 1999 was established to deliver public value and was clearly not launched as a commercial venture. Hence, despite the legal status of the S4C2 channel, we believe that the current content of the channel should be considered separately and judged on its editorial merits as public service output.
- 4.26. It will of course be a matter for the S4C Authority to assess the public value of the Assembly service on S4C2 within the Authority's governance and approvals framework. It would seem to the BBC as the supplier of the content of the current service that this value does need to be weighed against the potential benefits of providing a new service for children, if its loss is a necessary consequence of this proposal.
- 4.27. The Authority might therefore wish to consider the contribution which the Assembly service might in practice make to the delivery of purposes identified by Ofcom in its public service television broadcasting review. These include: *"to inform ourselves and others and to increase our understanding of the world through news, information and analysis of current events and ideas"*, *"to reflect and strengthen our cultural identity"* and to *"reflect the lives of other people and other communities, both within the UK and elsewhere"*.
- 4.28. In turn, these might be weighed against matters such as the availability of other sources of political coverage; changes in technology; and greater public knowledge and understanding of the politics of Wales and the procedures of the Welsh Assembly.

Performance

- 4.29. As noted earlier, the BBC's coverage of the National Assembly on S4C2 is outside the scope of the Strategic Partnership Agreement.
- 4.30. However the Agreement sets out a framework of performance indicators to measure the success of our contribution to S4C. They reflect the approach adopted by the BBC Trust's framework of indicators based around the four drivers of public value namely: Reach, Quality, Impact and Value for money.
- 4.31. These indicators are described in the Strategic Partnership Agreement as follows:
- Reach and usage: the BBC's overall contribution to S4C should reach a broad range of viewers and, (where appropriate or noted in the Editorial Synopsis), be widely used, with S4C viewers being provided with a significant amount of high-quality content to enjoy.
 - Quality and distinctiveness: the BBC's programmes should aim to contribute to the high quality, distinctiveness and creative excellence of the S4C services.
 - Impact: the BBC's contribution should have impact with Welsh language television audiences, with the constituent parts of this characteristic being that programmes should be challenging, engaging and memorable and (where appropriate) entertaining.
 - Cost and value-for-money: the BBC's contribution should represent value-for-money to licence-fee payers.
- 4.32. In each of these areas we suggest that the S4C Authority might wish to include the following comments alongside any quantitative or qualitative research that the Authority might conduct.

Reach

- 4.33. Obtaining objective measures on S4C2's reach, share, number of viewers and hours of viewing is difficult since BARB reports no information on viewing to S4C2.
- 4.34. Our own research is gleaned from BBC Wales tracking surveys conducted annually by Beaufort Research. In these, we ask which digital channels from a long list do respondents "ever watch nowadays".
- 4.35. The latest data is from November 2005, which showed that 1.5% of adults in Wales claimed to "ever watch" S4C2 nowadays. This would equate to 35,000 people but we consider this to be an overestimate due to potential over-claiming and mistaking S4C2 for S4C Digidol.
- 4.36. However, a comparison with BBC Parliament provides some context. The average afternoon audience for BBC Parliament is 2,500 across the UK, which suggests an audience of around 200 in Wales. The in-home audience to S4C2 at any given time in the afternoon would probably be of a similar order.
- 4.37. BARB reports a monthly reach (15' consecutive) of 350,000 for BBC Parliament, which suggests a pro rata figure of around 17,000 in Wales. It is unlikely that S4C2's reach is much higher than this, again an indication that the above figure of 35,000 is too high.

Quality

- 4.38. Perhaps the greatest users of the service are the various NGOs, Trade Unions, Government Departments and media organisations who use S4C2 to monitor debates, the progress of reports and to follow inquiries and evidence given to committees.
- 4.39. In the absence of any objective evidence (i.e. Als), our assessment can only be based upon an impressionistic feel of audience perception and anecdotal comment. That perception suggests that the service is highly valued by a small number of people and anecdotally, the response from politicians in the National Assembly and Westminster is favourable.

Impact

- 4.40. Anecdotal evidence again suggests that the service's impact on the general public is minimal, though it is a service perceived as being informative and engaging by its users.

Value for Money

- 4.41. We cannot calculate the usual metric of Cost per Viewer Hour due to the lack of audience data.

5. The proposed new Welsh language service for children

Context

- 5.1. Since 1982, BBC Wales has been proud to supply many of the most popular and most appreciated programmes on S4C as part of its provision of at least ten hours of programming a week.
- 5.2. In 2004, the BBC welcomed the publication of S4C's Programme Strategy which emphasised creative excellence as the hallmark of the S4C Digidol service. The publication of the strategy provided a clarity of intent and direction that was most welcome. It led directly to the formulation of the Strategic Partnership described earlier.
- 5.3. We recognise that the current proposal to establish a television service for children also follows directly from the S4C Programme Strategy. And that, as a 'new service', it requires the approval of the S4C Authority under the powers set out in the Communications Act 2003 and the approval of the Secretary of State for Culture Media and Sport.
- 5.4. Similar provisions are enshrined in the BBC Charter which makes clear that the BBC also should be able to introduce new UK public services, or significantly change or terminate existing services, for example, to respond to changes in technology, culture, market conditions, public expectations, and so on, subject where appropriate to the application of the Public Value Test.

Proposals

- 5.5. The consultation document outlines the approach whereby the S4C Authority would ask the Secretary of State for Culture Media and Sport to set out a public service remit for the New Service.

- 5.6. One model worth considering in this regard might be that of the Service Licences required to be adopted by the BBC Trust as a measures based accountability framework to ensure that each BBC service creates public value by delivering the BBC's Public Purposes.
- 5.7. The BBC Trust published Service Licences for CBeebies and CBBC on 30th April, 2007. They set out the key characteristics of each service and can be found at www.bbc.co.uk/bbctrust

Characteristics of the New Service

- 5.8. We recognise the potentially significant benefits for children and teenagers in the provision of continuous programming throughout the day and welcome the ambition for the New Service as set out in Part 1 of the consultation document.
- 5.9. In response to Part 1, para 3 of the consultation document, there are some areas where further clarity would aid the debate:
 1. What would be the New Service's public purposes and performance measures?
 2. Would the New Service be subject to relevant Ofcom Tier 2 quotas? (for example, CBBC and Cbeebies are subject to original production quotas)
 3. The consultation document's cover page and Chairman's letter refer to "*a new Welsh language television channel for children*". However, references within the document refer to the service holding "*a relevancy to all Children in Wales*" and being "*a mainly Welsh language service*".
 - i. Would it be a Welsh language service or would there be output in English?
 - ii. If so, what would be the balance between the two languages and what assessment has the Authority made as to the value of such provision?
 - iii. Would there be programmes for teenagers in English in the peak hours?
 4. How would the New Service on 'two-channels' for 'three audiences' be branded?
 5. By when is it estimated that the New Service will reach its maximum hours of broadcast of 15 hours a day between 6.00am and 9.00pm?
 6. Does the reference to "*news programmes tailored to their (children's) unique requirements and from their unique perspective*" suggest that other news output will be required from the BBC or from others?
- 5.10. Also, the insights we refer to in section 2 appear to confirm the Authority's view that Welsh language television is becoming less and less relevant in children's and teenagers' lives. The rapidly changing attitudes of the target audiences to media, mobility and choice suggest that other delivery methods might become as, if not more, effective. Hence, the Authority might wish to consider launching a new service (or parts of it for specific audiences) on broadband and mobile platforms only.

5.11. In addition, in light of the statutory obligation on the BBC and as part of the Editorial Planning Framework, we will need to discuss and agree with S4C where our programmes for children and teenagers will appear on S4C, S4C Digidol and S4C2.

5.12. Finally, with our own talent initiatives in BBC Wales and the opportunities provided by close collaboration with Radio Cymru's C2 youth strand, we suggest that joint approaches to talent development should be established.

The Options

5.13. The consultation sets out three capacity options which we understand to be as follows:

Option 1		
S4C Digidol	Normal schedule	Mon-Sun from 12:30 to 00:00
	Children's programmes	Mon-Sun from 06:00 to 12:30
S4C2	Welsh Assembly	Tue to Thu from 09:00 to 18:00
	Children's programmes	Remainder of schedule from 06:00 to 21:00

Option 2		
S4C Digidol	Normal schedule	Mon-Sun from 12:30 to 00:00
S4C2/ New Service	Children's programmes	Mon-Sun from 06:00 to 21:00

Option 3		
S4C Digidol	Normal schedule	Mon-Sun from 12:30 to 00:00
S4C2	Welsh Assembly	Tue to Thu from 09:00 to 18:00
New Service	Children's programmes	Mon-Sun from 06:00 to 21:00

5.14. It is planned that S4C's current digital services – S4C Digidol and S4C2 - will move to BBC multiplex capacity, (Mux B) in Wales only, from the start of digital switchover in Wales from 2009. We understand that S4C will then have access to freed-up capacity on the SDN multiplex, Mux A (the reserved capacity that S4C currently uses).

5.15. Therefore we welcome the comment in Part 3, 2.1 that digital terrestrial capacity has been reserved for S4C to launch additional free-to-air Welsh language services and we assume that this refers to S4C's reserved capacity on the SDN multiplex.

- 5.16. However, we should clarify the comment in Part 1, 4.2 which says - *“This means that we are running a second channel at less than full capacity, and it is this capacity, either around the hours used for the Assembly or alone, that we will use for the New Service.”*
- 5.17. We understand that this may be the case with S4C’s reserved capacity on the SDN multiplex (MuxA) and suggest as above that S4C should negotiate to use that capacity. However we should emphasise that from switchover in Wales, when it is planned that S4C2 will move to Mux B, there is no spare capacity either side of the current hours of the S4C2 Assembly service schedule as this capacity is to be used by BBC services.
- 5.18. The discussions between the BBC and S4C regarding the move of S4C Digidol and the current S4C2 service to Mux B in Wales are ongoing.

Option 1

- 5.19. The current broadcasting schedule on S4C Digidol includes children’s programmes (Planned Plant) Monday to Friday 4.00pm – 6.00pm.
- 5.20. It is not clear in these proposals whether these hours on S4C Digidol will be released for other programming. If not, could they even be extended to accommodate children’s programming between 3.00pm and 6.00pm on S4C Digidol while S4C2 broadcasts the Assembly service?
- 5.21. However we recognise the disadvantages of the interrupted service that even this option entails.

Option 2

- 5.22. The cessation of the Assembly service on S4C2 would release the daytime hours from Tuesday to Thursday, 9.00am – 6.00pm for the New Service.
- 5.23. In addition, the consultation’s description of Option 1, points out that the spare capacity on S4C Digidol between 6.00am – 12.30pm is also available for pre-school programming.
- 5.24. We suggest that this capacity in the morning on S4C Digidol could be used for live or recorded broadcasts of Assembly committees on Tuesdays – Thursdays. The same capacity on other days of the week could be used for recorded transmissions of plenary sessions and committees.
- 5.25. In this scenario, the existing BBC Wales/S4C joint editorial relationship to provide coverage of the National Assembly could continue.
- 5.26. However the coverage would not provide live broadcasts of plenary sessions or First Minister’s questions. It would not be ‘gavel-to-gavel’ coverage and therefore its public value would need to be set alongside other television coverage of the National Assembly provided by BBC Wales and ITV Wales.
- 5.27. Also to reiterate, there is no spare capacity on the BBC multiplex beyond the current S4C2 Assembly service schedule.

Option 3

- 5.28. This would appear to us to be the capacity option that could accommodate S4C's aspirations for a New Service and its current free-to-air channels S4C Digidol and S4C2.
- 5.29. We suggest that S4C could utilise its reserved capacity on the SDN multiplex to carry the New Service.
- 5.30. In this scenario, S4C Digidol and the S4C2 Assembly service could be accommodated on the BBC multiplex as planned and the New Service could use S4C's reserved capacity on the SDN multiplex.

6. Conclusion

- 6.1. In section 5 we have provided the context for our response to the three options presented in the consultation document. We should stress that we recognise that any decision to change the use that is made of S4C2's digital capacity is a matter for the S4C's Authority to consider and to seek approval from the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport.
- 6.2. To us it would appear that Option 3 is the one that achieves the objective of establishing a new television service for children while at the same time continuing to provide coverage of the National Assembly for Wales. If our understanding of the point made in Part 3, 2.1 is correct then this can be achieved because the capacity will be available on the SDN multiplex as part of S4C's reserved capacity. It will be a matter for the S4C Authority to consider whether the funding should be made available for this option.
- 6.3. However if the realistic choice is between Options 1 and 2 then we believe that the matter for the S4C Authority will be to weigh the public value of providing a new coherent children's service against its assessment of the public value of continued coverage of the National Assembly on S4C2.

Appendix A

The Questions asked in the consultation document

1. Do you agree with our view that a dedicated service for Children will enhance the public service offering in the Welsh language for Children?
 - c.f. Section 3

2. Do you have any comments / what are your views about the proposed hours of broadcast and the target audiences?
 - c.f. Section 5 and Section 1

3. What would you consider to be the most important key characteristics for television services for Children provided by S4C?
 - c.f. 5.5 – 5.12

4. Do you have any comments on the options set out at paragraph 4 and in particular option 1 and 2? Do you have any other comments you would like us to consider on this issue?
 - c.f. Section 5

5. Do you believe that a third party provider would be willing to provide a Welsh language television service for Children of a similar nature to that outlined above on a commercial basis?
 - We do not believe that a Welsh language television service as described would be offered by another provider on a commercial basis.

6. Can you identify any other stakeholders we should be contacting not included at Annex A?
 - We suggest that the following could be added to the list of stakeholders: House Committee of the National Assembly for Wales, Arts Council of Wales, Mentrau Iaith, BECTU, NUJ, Equity, Writer's Guild, Cyfle, Skillset

7. Do you have any other comments you would like us to consider in relation to this Consultation on a new Welsh language television channel for Children?
 - c.f. main document

Appendix B

BBC Wales's political coverage

1. Before Devolution:

In 1998, the year before devolution, BBC Wales produced over 100 hours of dedicated political programmes. Politics was of course covered extensively in both news and current affairs output. It was an exciting time in Welsh politics with the Government of Wales Act reaching the statute book, putting the legislation in place to set up the first ever National Assembly for Wales. Ron Davies battled it out with Rhodri Morgan to become Labour's candidate for the First Secretary of the Assembly, and of course his subsequent 'moment of madness' on Clapham Common gained hours of coverage.

This is a breakdown of BBC Wales's dedicated political output that year.

BBC 1:

Welsh Questions - monthly programme of record showing Welsh Question Time from the Commons - 30" x 9 programmes

BBC2:

Welsh Lobby - weekly political round up - 30" x 33 programmes
Live conference programmes - broadcasts from the Welsh Party Conferences - 2'00 x 4 programmes.

S4C:

Maniffesto - weekly political round-up - 30" x 34 programmes
Pawb a'i Farn - weekly political debate programme with a live audience - 50" x 14 programmes
Live conference programmes - broadcasts from the Welsh Party Conferences - 2'00 x 4 programmes.

Radio Wales:

People's Assembly - weekly debate programme with live audience - 30" x 40 programmes
Political coverage, mostly news based, with additional ad hoc political output mostly presented by Patrick Hannan.

Radio Cymru:

Wythnos Gwilym Owen, Manylu and Llinyn Mesur all regularly covered politics as did News programmes, but no dedicated political programme.

Online:

News Online started in 1997 - there wasn't a specific place for welsh politics on the site.

2. Current output:

BBC1 + BBC2:

Dragon's Eye - weekly investigative political series - 30" x 30

BBC1:

The Politics Show - weekly political programme - 20" x 35

BBC2:

AM PM - twice weekly programme of record covering Assembly and Westminster, including First Minister's Questions from the Assembly, Welsh Questions and Prime Minister's Questions from the Commons. - 60" x 30/ 90" x 30 programmes

Conference Live - annual broadcasts from the Welsh party conferences - 2'00 x 4.

S4C:

Manifffesto - weekly political round-up of UK-wide stories - 30" x 34 (soon to be re-launched with a new title in a mid week late evening slot)

Pawb a'i Farn - weekly debate programme with live audience - 50" x 14

Conference Live - broadcasts from Welsh Party conferences - 2'00 x 4.

S4C2:

gavel-to-gavel coverage of Assembly proceedings - 27 hours a week, 35 weeks a year

Radio Wales:

Called to Order - weekly discussion programme - 30" x 40

Radio Cymru:

Dau o'r Bae - weekly discussion programme - 45" x 35.

Online:

dedicated political pages on News Online sites and Political Editor's blog

Arlein:

dedicated political pages on Newyddion Arlein and Vaughan Roderick's blog

Radio 4:

weekly contribution by Adrian Masters to Yesterday in Parliament

BBC Parliament:

Dragon's Eye is broadcast on BBC Parliament as are key debates from the Assembly chamber.

3. Assembly Elections & General Elections:

BBC1, S4C, Radio Wales, Radio Cymru and Online/Arlein
- live results programmes produced by the political and news teams every two years since 1999.

During the 2007 election campaign there were three hour-long election debate specials on BBC1, and three additional Pawb a'i Farn hour long debates on S4C.

"Your Election" on BBC 2W looked at the election campaign including viewer contributions and issues raised by members of the public – 30" x 3.

4. Ceremonial Openings of the Assembly:

BBC Wales broadcast extensive coverage of The Royal Opening of the Senedd in 2006.

Following each Assembly election BBC Wales has broadcast special programmes showing the Queen officially marking the start of the new political term.

5. Political coverage in daily news output:

Wales Today:

Average week - between 10% and 15% being political topics.
Election week - 40%

RADIO CYMRU:

Average week - 28%
Election week - 40%

RADIO WALES:

Average week - 30%
Election week - 38%

Newyddion on S4C:

Average week - 15%
Election week - 30%

6. By-elections.

Since 1999 there have been two Assembly by-elections in Swansea East and Blaenau Gwent – both were covered in special TV and Radio programmes in English and Welsh on BBC Wales services and S4C.