



Ymgynghoriad gan Awdurdod S4C
An S4C Authority Consultation

Ar Gynigion ar gyfer darpariaeth sianel deledu Gymraeg i blant a phobl ifanc yn y dyfodol.

On Proposals for the future provision of a Welsh language television channel
for children and Young People.

Gwasanaethu Plant yn y Dyfodol Digidol Serving Children in the Digital Future

Darganfyddiadau'r Ymgynghoriad Consultation Findings

Contents

<i>Introduction</i>	3
<i>Original Documents Published</i>	4
<i>Executive Summary</i>	4
<i>Methodology</i>	7
<i>Children and Young People</i>	8
<i>Adults (Individuals)</i>	10
<i>Adults (Organisations)</i>	15
<i>Summary of Findings</i>	21
<i>Responses Received</i>	22
<i>List of Organisations that Responded</i>	23
<i>Others Consulted</i>	23

Serving Children in the Digital Future

Introduction

Independent research conducted on behalf of S4C, and research conducted by others, had indicated that children and young people have dramatically changed the way in which they consume audio visual media. Children's television also received greater focus when Ofcom announced a review of children's television and other children's media in the UK as part of its planned schedule of work on the future of Public Service Broadcasting in the digital age.

In order to compete with other channels and media aimed at children and young people S4C concluded that a dedicated Welsh language service for children and young people was required.

No new television programme service can be provided by the S4C Authority unless the service has been approved by an order made by the Secretary of State for Culture, Media and Sport under Section 205(1) of the Communications Act 2003. The S4C Authority is the independent body which is accountable for S4C's output whilst the Chief Executive, S4C officers and staff manage and maintain S4C including providing S4C's services.

S4C presented its proposals to the S4C Authority and sought its support in seeking an order from the Secretary of State. The current proposal is for a remit to be set out for a new service, similar to S4C digidol, but primarily aimed at children and young people.

It is intended that the new service will be

- transmitted free to view on all appropriate delivery methods
- available for 15 hours a day between 0600 and 2100 hours when fully developed
- run on two different channels, in order to provide services for three diverse audiences i.e. pre-school, older children and teenagers.

A significant proportion of programming is expected to be original home-grown programming produced in Wales, to the high production values expected of S4C programming.

The new service will be a mainly Welsh language service, and the S4C Authority will lay down a Welsh language policy for the new service as it currently does for S4C digidol.

It is proposed that the new service will use capacity already available on the channel S4C2, which currently broadcasts the proceedings of the National Assembly for Wales from Tuesday-Thursday from 0900-1800 hours. Of the possible capacity options three were set out as examples.

No additional funding is being sought for the new services as set out. The intention is to fund it through existing methods, i.e. a combination of public monies and commercial revenues.

In order to seek the views of the public and key stakeholders on the proposals to launch a new Welsh language public service for children and young people, in May 2007 the S4C Authority published a consultation paper – Serving Children in the Digital Future. The closing date for receiving all responses was 20 July 2007.

The consultation, which generated several hundred responses in total, was not a quantitative research exercise, so was not subject to statistical analysis. The interpretation of the data was carried out on an individual basis, using qualitative market research techniques to analyse and present respondents' views and opinions, and look for any underlying themes.

In order to ensure an independent assessment an independent marketing and research consultancy was commissioned to collate, analyse and report on the responses on behalf of the Authority.

The S4C Authority will consider the pros and cons of the findings from the consultation process and consider whether to proceed with an application for a Secretary of State order. If the S4C Authority agree to proceed the information gathered will be used as evidence in support of an order.

Original Documents Published

The original Consultation paper - Children in the Digital Future – and the original Response Form can be seen by following the links below.

[Original consultation paper](#)

[Original response form](#)

The questionnaire for Children and Young People was web based and can also be seen by following the link below.

[Original questionnaire for children](#)

Executive Summary

1.1 The S4C Authority published the consultation paper *Gwasanaethu Plant yn y Dyfodol Digidol/Serving Children in the Digital Future* in May 2007, seeking the views of the public and key stakeholders on its proposals to launch a new Welsh language public service television channel for children and young people.

1.2 The consultation generated 347 responses from children and young people, 103 individual responses from adults and 40 responses from organisations. The data were interpreted using qualitative market research techniques to analyse and present respondents' views and opinions, and to identify any underlying themes.

1.3 The views expressed in the children and young people's consultation represent a fairly narrow age band. Nearly all those who responded were in the 10-14 age group.

1.4 The majority of the respondents aged under 16 were in favour of the proposed new service in principle. A total of 305 respondents agreed that creating a new Welsh television channel for children and teenagers would be better than what is available now, while 42 disagreed (Q1).

1.5 These respondents perceived the morning viewing slot, both on weekdays and weekends, as being overwhelmingly for the under-5s and (less so) for the under-10s. Weekday lunchtime broadcasting could be dedicated to under-5s with little negative response from older children, although at weekends, programming for 5-10 year olds, and to a lesser extent for 10-16s, would also be expected in this slot. While some competition for the weekday after school and weekend afternoon time slots was indicated by the responses, the evening was perceived to be very much the preserve of the 10-16 age group.

1.6 Reasons for children and young people's support of the proposals fell into two main categories. The first category was to do with reinforcing their pride in the Welsh language, and improving their own – and other children and young people's – command of the language.

1.7 The second main category of responses reflected general approval for the increased choice of viewing options which would be offered by the new services. Many respondents were expressing an expectation that the programmes offered by the new service would be better than those which are available at present; in particular that there would be more programming for teenagers, for whom it was perceived there was very little on S4C at the moment.

1.8 Respondents specified a preference for content relating to music, sport, drama and lifestyle including fashion and relationships. There was a general expectation that the programmes would compare favourably with their English language favourites.

Adults (individuals)

1.9 The overall response to S4C's proposals was favourable, with many individual respondents welcoming the extension of broadcasting hours for children and young people very warmly. Of the total 103 responses received, 97 agreed that a dedicated service or block for children and young people will enhance the public service in the Welsh language for children and young people, only one answered no, and five did not answer the question (Q1).

1.10 The majority of individual respondents were parents. Their support for the proposals was mainly the result of their desire for their children to hear more Welsh in the home, especially so in the case of

pre-schoolers. This was equally true for Welsh-speaking parents who wish to reinforce the home language, and for non-Welsh speaking parents, who use S4C to extend and support the Welsh that their children are learning at school or nursery. Parental concern that their children are exposed to too much English in the home is a powerful driver.

1.11 Many respondents expressed the view that Welsh speaking children and young people should have access to the same level of service as English speakers, so that the new proposals were seen as being inherently fairer. This was welcomed as a further step towards normalising the status of the Welsh language.

1.12 Respondents were of the opinion that the new service would need to be very strongly branded and that services for each age group would need their own identity. Planed Plant and Planed Plant Bach, cited and praised by many respondents, are obviously strong and well recognised brands, and people wanted these to be the basis upon which to build the new service.

1.13 There was an expectation that the new service would offer high quality programming, with this seen as a key requirement. CBBC and Cbeebies were held up as the 'gold standard', and would be the kind of services that parents would expect S4C to aspire towards.

1.14 There were two main categories of negative comments about the proposals. Several respondents were unhappy that the suggested broadcast hours for the younger age group did not entirely fit in with modern family lifestyles. Working parents, whose pre-schoolers are at nurseries or crèches all day, are mainly looking for entertainment for their children in the 'bedtime hour' between 6-7 or 7.30pm, and so were expressing disappointment that the proposed new service would not be broadcasting programmes for under-5s in the early evening.

1.15 The use of the current statutory wording relating to language and its adoption for the new service elicited a number of responses that deemed it too vague. There were mixed views on the language policy, but it is probably fair to say that most of those who expressed concern wanted S4C to state categorically that the new service would be an entirely Welsh language one.

1.16 Most responses to the proposed hours of broadcast and target audiences were positive, although there is a perception that the hours offered will still not compete with comparable English language services. People are however pragmatic on the whole, and accept that within the dual constraints of finance and capacity, S4C's proposals go a long way towards redressing the balance. There is a fundamental mismatch between three target audiences and only two channels so that most respondents accept that provision will always be compromised to some extent.

1.17 Regarding the most important key characteristics for television services provided for children and young people by S4C (Q5), quality of programming was the one which came up most often. Originality was often mentioned, but well-dubbed adaptations are also acceptable. Parents commented that there is certain kudos for the language if their children's favourite characters speak Welsh.

1.18 Availability and accessibility were a recurring theme. It was felt to be extremely important that the programming for 5-10 year olds in particular was included on the Electronic Programme Guide (EPG) under KIDS, so that children always knew where and when to find it. Teenagers were thought to find programmes via the normal adult menus, so that to catch their eye it would be vital for the new service to be strongly and appealingly branded.

1.19 The main differences between the views expressed by individuals and organisations had to do with attitudes towards the broadcasting of the National Assembly proceedings. Although a few individual respondents expressed concern at the implications of the new proposals for the National Assembly coverage, the majority of comments favoured giving the children and young people's service priority.

1.20 Overall, the 103 individual responses to the consultation suggest that S4C's proposed new children and young people's service:

- will be very warmly welcomed, especially by parents, and is believed in some quarters to be long overdue;
- must make high quality programming a priority;
- should make its language policy very clear from the outset;

- must be strongly and appropriately branded for the three different target audiences, and promoted aggressively via suitable platforms for each audience;

Organisations

1.21 As for the individuals, most of the organisations were very definitely in favour of the S4C proposals for enhancing the provision for children and young people.

1.22 There was much more emphasis among the organisations than the individuals on the importance of multi-platform provision and interactivity.

1.23 Several comments were made regarding the segmenting of the target audience, not all concurring with the breakdown suggested in the proposals. It was felt that programming for 10-16 year olds would not work, as 14-16s are very different in their level of maturity and viewing tastes from 10-13s. Views were expressed that 5-10 may also be too wide an age range, and that children's tastes change at around age 7.

1.24 The vital importance of continuity and consistency of accessibility was stressed by organisations as well as individuals. Respondents noted that they would prefer to see S4C's adult programmes rather than the children and young people's channel supplanted by Eisteddfod coverage, for example.

1.25 As regards key requirements, high quality of programming was mentioned most often among the organisations as well as the individuals. Originality of programmes featured more prominently in the organisations' responses, and S4C was asked to continue to commission original programming from Welsh companies in particular.

1.26 The issue of the language of the channel came up very strongly in the organisational responses, with several arguing very firmly that there should be no ambiguity and that the new channel must be a totally Welsh language channel. Some respondents however, were in favour of provision for English-speaking parents bringing up bilingual children and young people, especially for pre-schoolers.

1.27 The need for the new services to be adequately funded was highlighted in many responses – both individual and organisational. Doubt was expressed that without increased funding, S4C would not be able to provide the enhanced service to acceptable quality levels. There is a perception that S4C is already under-funded so that channelling money to the new service will have negative implications for the rest of S4C's output.

1.28 Responses to the implications of the proposals on coverage of the National Assembly coverage were detailed and varied. Several commented that they did not believe the possible options proposed in the consultation offered the best solutions, and some were asking for further discussions on this issue.

1.29 The importance of branding and marketing the new service was highlighted by many organisations. Effective cross-promotion between S4C's channels was also seen as essential, as the point was made that one side effect of setting up a dedicated channel for children and young people could be a loss of viewers to S4C's other services unless programmes were trailed on the new channel.

1.30 The overall impression gained from the organisational responses is:

- that the proposed new service is seen as a welcome opportunity to offer Welsh-speaking children and young people enhanced television services.
- S4C's commitment to providing this service is commended, at a time when many UK broadcasters seem to be backing away from young people's provision.
- There is, however, a significant number of organisations for whom their basic approval of the enhancement of Welsh language television services for children and young people is tempered by a concern that the S4C proposals as outlined in the consultation document will have a negative impact on access to television coverage of the National Assembly proceedings.

1.31 The S4C Authority will consider the pros and cons of the findings from the consultation process and consider whether to proceed with an application for a Secretary of State order.

Methodology

2.1 A consultation questionnaire was prepared for children and young people aged under 16, and circulated via primary and secondary schools throughout Wales. This questionnaire sought to obtain the views of the target audiences on the principle of a new Welsh language television service and the preferred hours of broadcast of such a service. The questions included on the children and young people's questionnaire are listed at Annex 1. They were mostly closed questions, which could be answered by tick boxes. Only the final question was open-ended.

2.2 Adult responses were invited in one of three ways – by online questionnaire, by e-mail or by post. Those responding by e-mail and by post were asked to include a consultation coversheet with their comments, so that the specific questions which the Authority wished to consider were addressed directly by the majority, if not all, of the respondents. These questions are detailed at Annex 2. There were three specific yes/no questions and four open-ended questions. In addition, respondents were able to record further comments in support of their responses to the yes/no questions.

2.3 Walton Evans, an independent marketing and research consultancy, was commissioned to collate, analyse and report on the responses.

2.4 Two stakeholder consultation meetings were also held, one in Cardiff and one in Bangor. Transcripts of both these meetings were produced and fed into the analysis process.

2.5 Since the consultation, which generated several hundred responses in total, was not a quantitative research exercise, the findings have not been subject to statistical analysis. The interpretation of the data has been carried out on an individual basis, using qualitative market research techniques to analyse and present respondents' views and opinions, and to identify any underlying themes.

2.6 All individual responses have been anonymised and all requests for confidentiality respected during the analysis and reporting.

2.7 The findings are presented in three separate sections, namely

- Children and young people
- Adults (individuals)
- Adults (organisations)

2.8 In the section on the children and young people's consultation, the findings are presented question by question. However, in both adults' consultation sections, this format has not been followed, mainly because there was considerable duplication in the answers to questions 1, 4, 5 and 7. It therefore seemed more logical to present these findings under themed headings. Questions 2 and 6 were more specific, and the responses to these questions are therefore presented under the question heading.

2.9 Anonymised verbatim quotes from the responses are included in the text at appropriate points. They are presented in the original language, with an English translation also given for those which were originally in Welsh.

Children and Young People

3.1 The total number of respondents to the children and young people's consultation was 347. Their age and gender profile was as follows:

Age profile	
0-5yrs	2
6-10yrs	39
11-16yrs	308
Gender profile	
Boys	141
Girls	206

3.2 It is important to bear in mind that the views expressed in this exercise represent a fairly narrow age band. Nearly all those who responded to the consultation were in the 10-14 age group. There were a handful of 8/9 year olds and six 16 year olds, as well as two under-5s whose responses had been submitted by their parents on their behalf.

3.3 There was an indication that some sets of responses had been prepared at school and probably as a class exercise.

Question 1

3.4 The majority of respondents were in favour of the proposed new service in principle. A total of 305 respondents agreed that creating a new Welsh television channel for children and teenagers would be better than what is available, while 42 answered no.

Question 2

3.5 Do you think it's a good idea which appeals to the following age groups 0-5 yrs 5-10 yrs 10-16 yrs? elicited 314 yes answers and 29 no answers. Four respondents failed to answer this question.

Question 3

3.6 The following table summarises the responses to the broadcast hours options presented in the questionnaire. Respondents were asked to tick as many boxes as they wished; indicating when they thought programmes should be shown for each age group.

Day and time slot	0-5 yrs	5-10 yrs	10-16 yrs
Monday-Friday Morning	245	157	77
Lunchtime	172	54	31
Afterschool	151	279	224
Evening	25	48	264
Saturday-Sunday Morning	225	185	112
Lunchtime	199	170	89
Afternoon	139	198	215
Evening	23	58	245

3.7 Respondents perceive the morning viewing slot, both on weekdays and weekends, as overwhelmingly for the under-5s and (less so) for the under-10s

3.8 Weekday lunchtime broadcasting could be dedicated to under-5s with little negative response from older children, although at weekends, programming for 5-10 year olds, and to a lesser extent for 10-16s, would also be expected in this slot

3.9 Based on the responses there was some competition for the weekday after school and weekend afternoon time slots but the evening was perceived to be very much the preserve of the 10-16 age group.

“Mae rhaglenni da iawn gan s4c ar hyn o bryd, ond dydy nhw ddim ar y teledu ar amser sy'n siwtio fi. Byddai sianel dim ond ar gyfer plant yn syniad gwych!” (S4C has very good programmes on at present, but they're not on TV at a time that suits me. A channel just for children is a great idea!)

Question 4

3.10 A total of 281 responses to the final open ended question were recorded, all except one of these being in Welsh. As might be expected from the responses to Q1 and Q2 (see 4.4 and 4.5 above), the vast majority of the comments made were positive, indicating a great deal of goodwill towards S4C's current output and looking forward to more of the same.

3.11 Reasons for their support of the proposals fell into two main categories. The first category was to do with reinforcing their pride in the Welsh language, and improving their own – and other children's – command of the language. While many of these comments suggested they had been influenced by the respondents' parents and/or teachers, there were others which seemed to be reflecting genuinely held views by the young people themselves.

“Mae siarad Cymraeg ar sianel Cymraeg yn bwysig oherwydd mae'n rhoi iaith arall adref. Hefyd mae lot o pobl sydd yn mynd i Ysgol cymraeg yn siarad saesneg adref mae S4C yn atgofio nhw i siarad cymraeg adref.” (Speaking Welsh on a Welsh channel is important because it gives another language at home. Also a lot of people who go to Welsh school speak English at home, S4C reminds them to speak Welsh at home)

“Rydw i'n meddwl ei bod e'n syniad da oherwydd, mae e'n gallu helpu mwy o blant i siarad mwy o Gymraeg, ac i wella eu Cymraeg nhw.” (I think it's a good idea because it can help more children to speak more Welsh, and to improve their Welsh).

3.12 The second main category of responses reflected general approval for the increased choice of viewing options which would be offered by the new services. Many respondents were expressing an expectation that the programmes offered by the new service would be better than those which are available at present; in particular that there would be more programming for teenagers, for whom it was perceived there was very little on S4C at the moment.

“Rydw i'n credu ei fod yn syniad da i gael sianel Gymraeg i'r pobl ifanc , oherwydd mae s4c yn medru bod yn ddiflas i blant ond yn ddifyr i bobl hŷn . Ac os mae sianel Gymraeg dda ar y teledu byddwn ni DDIM yn gwyllo gymaint o raglenni Saesneg” (I believe it's a good idea to have a Welsh channel for young people, because S4C can be boring for children but interesting for older people. And if there's a good Welsh channel on TV we WON'T watch so many English programmes).

“Nid wyf yn gwyllo llawer o rhaglenni s4c ond os oedd yna pethau arno yn amlach ac yn dda byddaf yn gwyllo s4c mwy aml” (I don't watch many S4C programmes but if there were things on more often and they were good I'd watch S4C more often).

3.13 There were a few negative comments about the proposals, indicating that the respondents did not currently watch S4C at all, and would not be interested in a dedicated channel either. These respondents were all aged 11-16 and, in particular, included two of the six 16-year olds, who responded 'no' to both Q1 and Q2.

3.14 Many individual comments offered suggestions as to the sorts of programmes they would like to see on the new service. In the main, the genres cited were music , sport, drama and lifestyle including fashion and relationships and drama/soap opera. There were a few votes for nature and farming programmes, as well as various requests for competitions, especially those involving mess and gunge! There was a general expectation that the programmes would compare favourably with their English language favourites.

3.15 Other channels specified as models for the new service by this group of respondents were Jetix, MTV, Sky One and Bravo. There was no significant difference in favourite channels cited between the

various age groups of respondents, but again, in view of the fact that the vast majority were aged between 10 and 14, this is perhaps not surprising.

3.16 Several respondents referred to programmes on S4C (both the current and proposed new service) as being more suitable for their younger siblings than themselves e.g. cartoons such as Batman, Spiderman, Sponge Bob and Pokemon. One respondent (aged 16) noted that her younger brother would be delighted with the new service – implying that she did not believe it to be aimed at her at all.

3.17 Possibly surprisingly in view of the perception of the increasing role played by new technology and media platforms in children and young people's lives, there was only one reference in any of the responses to the internet or any kind of interactivity/online tie-up. This contrasted markedly with the emphasis placed on new platforms in the adults' responses (see section 5 below).

3.18 There is a definite suggestion that the older respondents to the consultation do not perceive the proposed new services as being targeted at them at all. Whether the same response would have been received if a separate questionnaire had been prepared for each age group (i.e. so that the phrase 'television channel for children and teenagers' was not used in the consultation document) is not known

Adults (Individuals)

4.1 The adult consultation generated a total of 103 individual responses (i.e. respondents who were responding on behalf of themselves or their families rather than any organisation). The demographic profile of these individuals is as follows:

Gender profile	
Males	44
Females	53
[rest unspecified]	
Language of response	
Welsh	65
English	38

4.2 84 respondents noted that they were responding on behalf of themselves. These respondents included one television producer, one IT consultant, one media consultant, one teacher at an English medium comprehensive school and one National Assembly Member. 19 respondents noted specifically that they were responding on behalf of their family.

Overall response

4.3 The overall response to S4C's proposals was favourable, with many individual respondents welcoming the extension of broadcasting hours for children and young people. Of the total 103 responses received, 97 agreed that a dedicated service or block for children and young people will enhance the public service in the Welsh language for children and young people, one answered no, and five did not answer the question. (Q1).

“Byddai sefydlu gwasanaeth teledu Cymraeg at gyfer plant yn gam pwysig - efallai yn un o'r camau allweddol? - at gyrraedd y nod a osodwyd yn Iaith Pawb, sef polisi Llywodraeth Cynulliad Cymru o gynyddu niferoedd siaradwyr Cymraeg gan 20% erbyn blwyddyn y Cyfrifiad nesaf sef 2011.”
(Establishing a Welsh television service for children would be an important step – perhaps one of the key steps? – towards achieving the aim set in Iaith Pawb, the Welsh Assembly Government's policy of increasing Welsh speakers by 20% by the next Census i.e. 2011).

4.4 The majority of individual respondents were parents and their reasons for welcoming the proposals were mainly to do with their desire for their children to hear more Welsh in the home, especially so in the case of pre-schoolers. This was equally true for Welsh-speaking parents who wish to reinforce the home language, and for non-Welsh speaking parents, who use S4C to extend and support the Welsh that their children are learning at school or nursery. Parental concern that their children are exposed to too much English in the home is a powerful driver.

4.5 The new service was wanted by many parents in order to address what is perceived as the inadequacy of current S4C provision, particularly at the two extremes of the age range i.e. the preschool years and teenagers.

“Mae'r gwasanaeth/bloc hwn i blant yn eu harddegau yn GWBL ANGENRHEIDIOL yn fy marn i os ydym am gyfoethogi profiad cyfryngol ein Cymry Cymraeg ifanc.” (This service/block for teenagers is ABSOLUTELY VITAL in my opinion if we wish to enrich the media experience for young Welsh speakers).

4.6 The new service was also welcomed as offering additional opportunities for parents and children to learn the language together. The educational support function of Welsh TV is a strong motivational force for non-Welsh speaking parents, especially when their children are very young.

4.7 Many respondents expressed the view that Welsh speaking children and young people should have access to the same level of service as English speakers, so that the new proposals were seen as being inherently fairer than the current situation. This was welcomed as a further step towards normalising the status of the Welsh language, one which has the potential of enhancing the use of the language among young people. The opportunity offered to boost young people's Welsh identity in a positive, modern, contemporary way, making the language increasingly relevant to their lives, was also mentioned by several respondents.

“Welsh children deserve a Welsh alternative to CBBC”

“Plant yw dyfodol unrhyw iaith, a rhaid darparu'n briodol ar eu cyfer”. (Children are the future of the language and they have to be provided for appropriately).

4.8 There is a perception, based on comments from a few respondents, that the current digital channel is not sufficiently used between 8am and 12 noon, and that the new service gives S4C an opportunity to redress this. Also, among some individuals S4C2 is seen as a somewhat 'unloved' channel by its own parent. The impression gained is that the service has been under funded and under marketed.

Branding and marketing the new service

4.9 Branding and marketing were recurring themes of the individual (and organisational) adult responses. Individuals commented that it is possible to use branding to separate two or more services on a single channel, using CBBC/BBC3 and Cbeebies/BBC4 as examples of how this can work.

4.10 Respondents were of the opinion that the new service would need to be very strongly branded and that services for each age group would need their own identity. Planed Plant and Planed Plant Bach, cited and praised by many respondents, are obviously strong and well recognised brands, and people wanted these to be the basis upon which to build the new service.

“Mae angen marchnata egniol ac effeithiol” (It needs to be marketed energetically and effectively)

Third party interest in running a comparable service (Q2)

4.11 Only 14 comments were received on this point. Most individual respondents felt unqualified to answer, and some said they didn't understand the question. Most of those who did answer said they wouldn't have thought the market would be valuable enough for a third party. Cynicism was expressed about the standard which would be provided. Some also felt quite strongly that providing a Welsh language television service should be a public service and one that S4C was under an obligation to provide.

4.12 Parents in particular would definitely not want the service to be commercially driven, and didn't want a large advertising content. The difference of approach between channels such as Cbeebies and Nick Jnr was cited, with the former being the preference of respondents who are parents.

Key requirements for the new service

4.13 Programme quality was the most popular key characteristic for the proposed service. CBBC and Cbeebies were held up time and again as the 'gold standard', and would be the kind of services that parents would expect S4C to aspire towards. The other channel mentioned most often as being watched by young children regularly was Nick Jnr.

“Give them something that they can't get anywhere else”.

4.14 Good quality programming means different things to different respondents. Originality was often mentioned, but well-dubbed adaptations are also welcomed. Parents commented that there is a certain kudos for the language if their children's favourite characters speak Welsh. In fact, the message came

over several times that S4C should not be afraid of dubbing good quality cartoons and animations from all over the world.

“Croesawaf yn frwd eich pwyslais ar raglenni GWREIDDIOL.. Yn y bôn stwff gwreiddiol unigryw Cymraeg sy'n mynd i werthu'r sianel, a'i lansio'n fenter newydd apelgar gyffrous”.(I welcome enthusiastically your emphasis on ORIGINAL programmes...Basically, it's unique original Welsh stuff that's going to sell the channel, and launch it as a new, appealing and exciting venture).

“not dubbed oriental cartoons”

“It is a good opportunity to look at all of the best parts of Welsh and English television and create something bigger and better”

4.15 Different opinions were expressed on the frequency and value of repeats. Respondents on the whole did not object to what they perceived as good quality programmes from the past being shown again, with an element of nostalgia apparent as parents wanted to share their own favourite children's programmes with their children.

4.16 Attention was drawn to the possible conflict between the educational and entertainment value of the new service. The point was made that although the new service could have an important role in supporting the curriculum, entertainment should be the priority.

4.17 Programmes aimed at learners were a priority requirement for many respondents, especially for parents and teachers of teenagers learning Welsh as a second language. A teacher in South Wales commented on the lack of confidence among second language speakers, who found that too much effort was required to watch Welsh TV.

“Too much effort after school when they just want to chill out.”

Broadcast hours

4.18 There were two main categories of negative comments about the proposals. Several respondents were unhappy that the suggested broadcast hours for the younger age group did not entirely fit in with modern family lifestyles. Working parents, whose pre-schoolers are at nurseries or crèches all day, are mainly looking for entertainment for their children in the 'bedtime hour' between 6-7 or 7.30pm, and so were expressing disappointment that the proposed new service would not be broadcasting programmes for under-5s in the early evening. One of the main reasons for the popularity of Cbeebies is its availability at this time of day.

4.19 Several respondents also suggested that children aged 5-10yrs don't need to be catered for until after 4pm, since most do not get home from school until then. These respondents believed that the new service should continue broadcasting programmes for under 5s until 4pm.

4.20 Apart from the points raised in 5.18-19 above, most responses to the proposed hours of broadcast were positive, although there is a perception that the hours offered will still not compete with comparable English language services. People are however pragmatic on the whole, and accept that within the dual constraints of finance and capacity, S4C's proposals go a long way towards redressing the balance. There is a fundamental mismatch between three target audiences and only two channels so that most respondents accept that provision will always be compromised to some extent, in particular at weekends.

Target audiences

4.21 Most individual responses to the proposed target audiences and age breakdown were positive. There was general agreement that separation between 12-16s and younger children has to be successfully achieved by the new service.

4.22 Several respondents were asking for consideration to be given to tailoring programming for different levels of linguistic ability. There was a suggestion that respondents did not necessarily believe that programming for learners has to be at the expense of fluent speakers.

4.23 There was general agreement that programmes for 5-10 yrs need to be under KIDS on the Electronic Programme Guide (EPG). Respondents commented that teenagers are choosing what to watch from adult menus, suggesting therefore that programmes for these age groups should be on the

main S4C channel but branded in a block. Comparisons were drawn with the C2 programmes on Radio Cymru. The point was raised, however, that this might annoy adult viewers.

4.24 A few individual respondents noted that there was a requirement for some learners' programming for school use.

Language of new service

4.25 The other main concern about the proposals was the language policy of the new service. The phrases 'a mainly Welsh language service' and 'a substantial proportion of the programmes consist of programmes in Welsh' in the consultation document were picked up by several respondents – both individuals and organisations – as being too vague.

4.26 There were mixed views on the language policy, but it is probably fair to say that most of those who expressed concern wanted S4C to state categorically that the new service would be an entirely Welsh language one. Several respondents were saying that they would expect and wish the service to be only in Welsh.

“Plis plis gochelwch rhag ildio i felltith dwyieithrwydd” (Please please avoid yielding to the curse of bilingualism)

4.27 The view was expressed that it is the role of the media, especially a public service broadcaster, to contribute to the development of children's linguistic skills. Television nowadays is an important factor in small children's development of idiomatic language. All children are currently unconsciously using English language television for this purpose; respondents argue that Welsh language television should be doing the same thing to a much greater extent than at present.

4.28 Many respondents commented that the language used in the new service should be accessible to Welsh learners, and some parents requested judicious use of on-screen subtitles in Welsh to help non-Welsh speaking parents.

4.29 The overall impression gained from the various comments about language is that people expect S4C to consider this matter very carefully and to ensure that the whole continuum of linguistic ability is catered for.

Funding of new service

4.30 Questions were raised by several respondents regarding the funding proposals for the new service. They seemed dubious as to whether it will be possible to provide the enhanced service at an acceptable quality without increased funding. There is a powerful perception that S4C is already under funded – typified in their view by lots of repeats – so channelling money to the new service will be detrimental to the existing service.

4.31 A couple of individual respondents were asking that S4C make representation to DCMS for enhanced funding specifically to increase the provision for children and young people, using the argument that providing a Welsh equivalent of the BBC children's output should happen as a matter of course.

Interactivity

4.32 Respondents noted the importance of involving and engaging the target audience, both via red button interactivity, website, programme-led games and so on but also by involving young people in programme planning and making.

“Adults' impressions of what teenagers find interesting is often way off the mark!”

Continuity and accessibility

4.33 Continuity of access was a recurring theme. It was felt to be extremely important that the programming for 5-10 year olds in particular was included under KIDS on the Electronic Programme Guide, so that children always know where and when to find it. The current patchy provision was regarded as confusing and therefore off-putting for many children.

4.34 Teenagers were thought to find programmes via the normal adult menus, so that to catch their eye it would be vital for the new service to be strongly and appealingly branded.

Capacity and coverage of Assembly proceedings (Q6)

4.35 The main differences between the views expressed by individuals and organisations in their consultation responses had to do with attitudes towards the broadcasting of the National Assembly proceedings. Although a few individual respondents expressed concern at the implications of the new proposals for the the National Assembly coverage, the majority of comments favoured giving the children and young people's service priority.

“Wrth reswm mae'n bwysig cyfathrebu beth sy'n digwydd yn y Bae ond mae cryfhau diwylliant Cymraeg ymhlith pobl ifanc yn bwysicach na darlledu'n fwy o'r Senedd”. (Naturally it's important to communicate what's happening in the Bay but strengthening Welsh language culture among young people is more important than broadcasting live from the Senedd)

“Dylid rhoi'r flaenoriaeth yn sicr i ddarparu sianel Gymraeg i blant a phobl ifanc. Os nad oes digon o gyllid i gynnal y ddau beth - plant yn sicr ddylai gael y flaenoriaeth yn fy marn i. Apelio at gynulleidfa gyfyng y mae'r darllediadau o'r Cynulliad.” (Priority should definitely be given to providing a Welsh channel for children and young people. If there isn't enough funding to maintain the two things – in my opinion, children should certainly get priority. Broadcasting from the Assembly appeals only to a narrow audience)

“It is crazy to suggest ending the service at the time when the Assembly's powers have been extended by the 2006 legislation and when the Assembly will be growing and accruing new powers. This is time to strengthen the service and not to end it.”

4.36 Of those who expressed an opinion on this matter, 5 respondents were in favour of Option 1, 23 respondents were in favour of Option 2, and 8 of Option 3 or another solution. Several commented that it seemed unreasonable to expect S4C to carry all the Assembly coverage since the proceedings were mostly in English.

“Credaf mai trefniadaeth gan drydydd parti/consortium fyddai orau i ddarlledu gweithrediadau'r Cynulliad, gan ryddhau'r sianel i blant yn unig. Un peth sydd wedi fy nharo yw pam y dylai Sianel Gymraeg S4C gario'r baich hwn, a'r rhan fwyaf o weithrediadau'r Cynulliad yn Saesneg?” (I believe that a third party/consortium arrangement would be best to broadcast Assembly activities, releasing the channel for children only. One thing that has struck me is why should S4C's Welsh language channel bear this responsibility, when most of the Assembly's activities are in English?)

4.37 The main argument against Option 1 is the confusion of children and young people's programming not always being available in the same place at the same time.

4.38 A lot of support was expressed by individual respondents for Option 2.

4.39 Some comments were made that Option 3 needs to be considered further, or some other way found of ensuring continuity of the National Assembly coverage via the BBC or red button options. Broadcasting the National Assembly proceedings at the end of the children and young people's schedule i.e. recorded rather than live, was also suggested.

“This would allow coverage of the National Assembly by choice, and not interfere with the new service to children.”

Adults (Organisations)

5.1 A total of 40 responses to the consultation document were received from organisations. The language profile of the responses and the numbers of various types of organisations responding are given below. A full list of the organisations submitting responses is given at Annex 3.

Language of response	
Welsh	30
English	8
Bilingual	2
Type of organisation	
Educational/youth organisations	12
Television (broadcasters/production/distribution)	12
Local authorities	2
Welsh language organisations	4
Government/public sector bodies	3
Other	7

Overall response

5.2 In the main, the points raised by the organisational responses were very similar to those expressed by individuals in section 5 above. Where there are differences, these are pointed out in the appropriate paragraphs. Organisations making specific points on some matters are identified where this was felt to be relevant.

5.3 As was the case for the individual respondents, most of the organisations were very definitely in favour of the S4C proposals for enhancing the provision for children and young people, with 29 answering yes to Q1. However, although no organisation answered this question in the negative, 11 did not answer the question directly.

“Mae’r gwasanaeth yma yn gyfle unigryw i ni fel cenedl ac mae’r sylw blaenllaw sy’n cael ei rhoi i’r iaith Gymraeg yn y ddogfen ymgynghorol yn cael ei groesawu’n fawr iawn” (This service is a unique opportunity for us as a nation and the prominent attention given to the Welsh language in the consultation document is very much welcomed) Opus.

5.4 Several respondents pointed out that the 2-channel 3-audience situation is always going to cause confusion.

5.5 The concepts of fairness and equality of opportunity featured prominently in the organisational responses, as they did with the individuals. Respondents believed that the proposed service, while not totally offering Welsh speaking children and young people the same opportunities as English speakers, was a vast improvement on the current provision.

“Cred Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg fod gan blant a phobl ifanc Cymru yr hawl i dderbyn gwasanaeth cyflawn trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg.” (Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg believes that the children and young people of Wales have the right to receive a full service through the medium of Welsh). Welsh Language Society

5.6 Stakeholder organisations and experts in the field of television made a number of specific technical points. These included comments and suggestions relating to cross promotion, duplication across the channels, use of multi-platform technology and capacity issues. Comparisons with other minority language television services in other parts of the world were also made e.g. by Mercator.

5.7 Concern about the implications of the new service as regards the National Assembly coverage was expressed by several organisations – including the National Assembly for Wales and the Welsh Assembly Government. Other organisations also expressing concern about this issue included the National Farmers’ Union, Wales Environment Link, the Countryside Council for Wales, the Welsh Language Board, Strata Matrix and the Wales Council for Voluntary Action.

“Whilst we recognise the importance of increased children’s programming we are concerned about the impact that this might have on coverage of Assembly proceedings”. NFU

“In the interests of a fair and open government, I believe it is vital that debates in the Assembly chamber are accessible to all.” Welsh Assembly Government

5.8 Language organisations emphasised the importance of the new service for developing and promoting the language for future generations of children and young people e.g. Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg, Twf, Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin.

Branding and marketing the new service

5.9 The importance of branding and marketing the new service was highlighted by many organisations. Effective cross-promotion between S4C’s channels was also seen as essential, as the point was made that one side effect of setting up a dedicated channel for children and young people could be a loss of viewers of S4C’s other services unless programmes were trailed on the new channel.

5.10 Some specific comments regarding branding made comparisons with other channels and services. Respondents wanted to see S4C taking risks with innovative methods of marketing the services to the target audience. The teenage audience is a particularly good candidate for developing innovative niche audience communication techniques.

5.11 Other respondents, in commenting on the need for effective cross-promotion, pointed out that much of the current S4C adult provision is attractive to young adults/teenagers e.g. drama such as *Con Passionate*, *Pobl y Cwm*, and some documentaries e.g. *Dewi Pws* travelogues. The point was made that one side effect of setting up a new dedicated channel could be the loss of some viewers for S4C’s other programmes unless there is effective cross promotion.

5.12 Several respondents suggested using joint promotion for marketing the new service by linking with children’s/young people’s events. Use of key partners e.g. Urdd, Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin to develop relationship marketing techniques was also suggested.

Third party interest in running a comparable service (Q2)

5.13 13 comments out of 40 responses were received. The views expressed were much the same as the individuals’ consultation responses. Stakeholders believe that only through public investment can such a service with high quality original programming be funded.

5.14 The role of public service broadcasting in providing a truly democratic service was stressed by one respondent (Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg).

5.15 In the context of this question, the restrictions on advertising sweets and less healthy foods etc on television are expected to make it an even less attractive commercial proposition. This issue, respondents believe, could lead to a decrease in the number of commercial children’s channels overall, and in the long run offer opportunities for public service broadcasters in ratings terms.

Key requirements for the new service

5.16 As regards key requirements, high quality of programming was mentioned most often among the organisations as well as the individuals. Original programming featured more prominently in the organisations’ responses, and S4C was asked to continue to commission original programming from Welsh companies in particular.

5.17 Respondents stressed their desire that S4C maintain the current high standard of their output for children and young people – and ensure ownership of the service by the young people themselves.

5.18 The references in the consultation document to commissioning original programming from Wales were warmly welcomed by production companies, PACT and TAC. These respondents were all pledging their support and willingness to be involved. Specific requests were made for drama series in particular to be commissioned, at least one for the 6-10 age group and one for the older age group.

5.19 Some respondents believe one main challenge in providing an enhanced service will be ensuring range and diversity.

5.20 A couple of respondents asking for particular attention to be given to children and young people with special needs (MYM, Acen), in terms of targeted programming, but also showing such children and young people in a positive light in society.

Broadcast hours

5.21 Respondent organisations generally welcomed the proposed increase in hours broadcast – within the caveat expressed by those who wished to safeguard the National Assembly coverage. Most organisations wished to see the maximum possible number of hours. The proposed scheduling was approved of by most respondents, except where noted below for pre-schoolers. One comment was made that broadcasting could maybe begin at 7am, rather than 6am.

5.22 Similar comments to those made by individuals were received from children’s organisations (MYM, Twf) about the preference for early evening viewing for young children. Some suggestions were made that programmes should be looped for extended periods (cf Cbeebies), to allow very young children ‘unlimited’ access to the Welsh language in the home and also in nurseries and crèches. The main point, once again similar to that made by the parents themselves in the individual responses, is the need for family viewing for young children in the early evening between 4-6pm. Parents need to be reassured that if they tune in during the after work mayhem hour or two there will be suitable programming for their under-5s.

5.23 Consistency of scheduling was the most common thread in comments, i.e. the importance of children and young people knowing when programmes are going to be on and always sticking to these hours. Changing programme times during school holidays was recognised as acceptable, but not changes without reason. Children and young people are creatures of habit and the point was made that if you disappoint them you’ll drive the audience away.

“Rhaid i sianel newydd fod ag oriau cyson. Yn yr oes uniongyrchol hon, mae plant yn gynulleidfa sy'n gofyn am ymdrech gyson i'w cadw'n hapus ac wedi eu diddanu'n gyson!” (A new channel must have consistent hours. In this instantaneous age, children represent an audience who require consistent effort to keep them happy and consistently entertained!) RhAG

“Annoeth fyddai newid yr oriau yn rhy fympwyol gan y byddai'r siom o ganfod nad oedd y rhaglen ddisgwyledig (ac efallai'n ffefryn) ddim ar gael ar yr amser arferol yn gallu achosi diflastod ac amharodrwydd i edrych eto, yn enwedig yn achos y plant iau”. (It would be unwise to change the hours on too much of a whim because the disappointment of finding that an expected (and perhaps favourite) programme is not available at the usual time could lead to unwillingness to look again, especially in the case of younger children) NUT Cymru

5.24 One suggestion was to use the ‘watershed’ concept in reverse for attracting teenage viewers i.e. promoting the fact that there will be no children’s programmes after 7pm.

Target audiences

5.25 Several comments were made regarding the segmenting of the target audience, not all concurring with the breakdown suggested in the proposals. Educational and young people’s organisations pointed out that curriculum changes being implemented at present are aimed at 14-19 year olds. It was felt that programming for 10-16 year olds would not work, as 14-16s are very different in their level of maturity and viewing tastes from 10-13s. The point was also made that young people always want to watch programmes meant for people slightly older than themselves.

5.26 Views were expressed by some children’s’ organisations that 5-10 may also be too wide an age range, and that children’s tastes change at around age 7. This ties in with the new Foundation Phase in education, which targets 3-7 year olds.

5.27 The response from Twf noted that there is a need to consider programming for families with babies (under 12 months), but whether this should be on the new service or on the existing digital channel was not specified. In particular, the target audience for such a service should be parents who have had Welsh medium education but haven’t spoken Welsh since, so lack confidence.

5.28 Some respondents, predominantly those with an educational focus (schools and teaching unions) were asking that the new service link in with curriculum developments. The issue of suitable programming for Welsh learners, however, was raised by many organisations, with Acen, in particular, suggesting a structured approach to segmenting the target audience by linguistic ability as well as age.

Language of new service

5.29 The issue of the language of the channel came up very strongly in the organisational responses, with several – particularly Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg – arguing very firmly that there should be no ambiguity and that the new channel must be a totally Welsh language channel. The BBC was one major stakeholder organisation asking for clarification of the linguistic balance between Welsh and English of the new service.

“Cred Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg fod gan blant a phobl ifanc Cymru yr hawl i dderbyn gwasanaeth cyflawn trwy gyfrwng y Gymraeg ac felly ni ddylid creu amheuaeth ar iaith y gwasanaeth o’r cychwyn cyntaf fel hyn.” (Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg believes that the children and young people of Wales have the right to receive a full service through the medium of Welsh and that therefore doubts about the language of the service should not be created at the outset in this manner). Welsh Language Society

5.30 There is a need, recognised by many other respondents, both individual and organisational, for provision for English speaking parents bringing up bilingual children – with particular attention needed to programming for such families with pre-schoolers. The overall message is that respondents have very definite views in this area and believe that S4C should aim to provide programming which is targeted right across the language continuum.

Funding of new service

5.31 The need for the new services to be adequately funded was highlighted in many responses – both individual and organisational. Doubts were expressed that, S4C would not be able to provide the enhanced service to acceptable quality levels without additional funding. There is a perception that S4C is already under-funded so that channelling money to the new service will have negative implications on the rest of the S4C output.

5.32 Some respondents expressed concern about the limited resources and particularly S4C’s statement that they are not seeking additional funding at this stage. Respondents were asking what implications this might have for the commitment to original programming.

Interactivity

5.33 There was much more emphasis among the organisations than the individuals on the importance of multi-platform provision and interactivity. The BBC, for example, pointed out that young people’s attitudes to and use of various media platforms are changing rapidly and it was felt that consideration should be given to making some parts of the new service suitable for broadband or mobile platforms only.

“The rapidly changing attitudes of the target audiences to media, mobility and choice suggest that other delivery methods might become as, if not more, effective. Hence, the Authority might wish to consider launching a new service (or parts of it for specific audiences) on broadband and mobile platforms only”. BBC

5.34 Other respondents also emphasised the need to ensure multi platforming and use of computers/internet/mobile and broadband, to fit in with children and young people’s general developing usage of these technologies.

“Dylai’r gwasanaeth fod yn aml-blatfform, Cymraeg, cyson o ran amserlen, eang o ran diddordebau, a phenodol o ran cynulleidfa darged. Dylid gwneud cyswllt pendant gydag arferion cyfryngol plant a phobl ifanc gan ddefnyddio safleoedd gwe. Dylai’r gwasanaethau hyn gynnig cyfleoedd i blant a phobl ifanc gynyddu eu hymwybyddiaeth a’u sgiliau o lythrennedd cyfryngol.” (The service should be multi-platform, Welsh, consistently scheduled, wide-ranging in terms of interests, and specific in terms of target audience. Definite links should be made with children and young people’s habits of media usage through websites. These services should offer children and young people opportunities to increase their media literacy awareness and skills) Mercator

Continuity and accessibility

5.35 The vital importance of continuity and consistency of accessibility of the new services was stressed by organisations as well as individuals. Respondents noted that they would prefer to see S4C digidol programmes rather than the children and young people’s channel supplanted by Eisteddfod coverage, for example.

“Yn yr amgylchfyd digidol credwn ei bod yn hanfodol i gael presenoldeb cyson, hawdd cael gafael arno, ar gyfer plant yn yr iaith Gymraeg.” (In the digital environment we believe it to be essential to have a consistent, easy-to-access presence in the Welsh language available for children) Grwp Boomerang

“Mae cynnig amserlen gyson a sefydlog yn un o’r elfennau pwysicaf wrth geisio meithrin patrymau gwyllo sefydlog” (Offering a consistent and stable schedule is one of the most important elements in trying to establish stability of viewing patterns). Mercator

Capacity and coverage of Assembly proceedings (Q6)

5.36 Organisations’ responses to Q6 and the issue of the National Assembly coverage were detailed and varied, with views varying by type of organisation. Several stakeholder organisations commented that they did not believe the possible options proposed in the consultation offered the best solutions, and some – the National Assembly for Wales included – were asking for further discussions on this issue.

5.37 Several organisations (including the Welsh Language Board) pointed out that live broadcasting of proceedings is becoming an increasingly expected part of democratic access to government throughout the world, and that losing this service in Wales would be a major step backwards, particularly at a time when the the National Assembly’s powers were being increased.

“Roedd penderfyniad S4C a’r BBC yn 1999 i greu partneriaeth ddarlledu trafodion y Cynulliad Cenedlaethol yn unigryw a blaengar. Byddai colli’r gwasanaeth hwn yn gam yn ôl, yn enwedig ar gyfnod pan fo’r Cynulliad yn cael mwy o bwerau ac yn awyddus i weld dinasyddion Cymru yn ymwneud â’i waith.” (The decision by S4C and the BBC in 1999 to create a partnership to broadcast National Assembly proceedings was unique and innovative. Losing this service would be a step backwards, especially at a time when the Assembly is getting increased powers and is eager to involve the citizens of Wales in its work) Welsh Language Board

“ [This would] undermine the Assembly’s core philosophy of openness and transparency, particularly in light of the Assembly’s recent reaffirmation of its commitment to increasing public awareness and understanding of the Assembly.” Wales Environment Link

5.38 In terms of specific responses to Q6, three organisations favoured Option 1, eight favoured Option 2 and 11 favoured Option 3 or another solution. The remaining 18 organisations did not offer a direct response to this question.

5.39 On the whole, children’s and young people’s organisations e.g. Urdd, were favouring Option 2, and were not in favour of mixing the National Assembly coverage and children and young people’s content on one channel.

“Credwn yn gryf y dylai sianel blant ddarparu gwasanaeth di-dor 7 diwrnod yr wythnos er mwyn denu a chadw gwylwyr ifanc, ac o’r herwydd credwn mai opsiwn 2 yw’r unig ddewis fydd yn cynnig sefyllfa ddefnyddiol i blant.” (We fervently believe that a children’s channel should provide an uninterrupted service 7 days a week in order to attract and keep young viewers, and therefore we believe that Option 2 is the only choice which will provide the ideal situation for children) Mudiad Ysgolion Meithrin

5.40 The use of red button interactivity, currently experienced by respondents for coverage of events such as the Royal Welsh Show and Eisteddfodau, was suggested by several. The Welsh Assembly Government was one organisation asking for consideration to be given to this idea, and also suggesting transmitting highlights after the end of children and young people’s programming for the day plus live streaming on the web. While others, including the National Assembly for Wales, believe web streaming to be a long term solution, their view is that for the moment not enough people have access to the internet.

“I would suggest that using the red button option could give viewers the ability to access Assembly debates at the same time as a full service for children is provided on the channel.” Welsh Assembly Government

5.41 One possible scheduling option (suggested by Cymdeithas yr Iaith Gymraeg) included using S4C2 for the National Assembly daily 9am-3.30 and for older children in the early morning and 3.30-9.30/10pm, with additional hours at weekends and holidays. This could allow the new service to be broadcast exclusively for under 7s, from 6am-7pm every day.

5.42 Several organisations are asking S4C to give further consideration to Option 3 or other solutions. Some other solutions, it is acknowledged, would not be possible without significant additional funding.

5.43 The BBC has stated that from switchover in Wales, when it is planned that S4C2 will move to Multiplex B, there is no spare capacity either side of the current hours of the S4C2 Assembly service schedule as this capacity is to be used by BBC services. However, the BBC suggested that there may be enough reserved capacity for the new services on existing SDN multiplexes.

“WEL would only accept Option 2, if we were assured that third parties would be taking over the provision of carriage for this service.” Wales Environment Link

Other comments

5.44 Some concern was expressed that the consultation itself had not been sufficiently wide or user-friendly. In particular, some respondents felt that S4C should have conducted face-to-face discussions with young people as the most important stakeholders, and should have consulted more widely among users of the National Assembly coverage on S4C2.

5.45 There were also comments (both from organisations and individuals) that the consultation document was not very easy to read and that consultees would have benefited from a summary in more accessible language.

Summary of Findings

6.1 Children and Young People

- Children and young people up to the age of 14 are likely to welcome the increased choice of programming offered by S4C's proposed new services.
- They acknowledge the value of Welsh language television to their lives and to their pride in their Welsh identity.
- Broadly speaking, they wish to see programmes for the under 5s on weekday and weekend mornings, for 5-10 year olds on weekdays after school and at weekend lunchtimes and afternoons, and for 10-16 year olds in the evenings.
- There are indications from the consultation responses that it will be more difficult for S4C to attract the older 14-16 age group, who currently perceive that S4C is not really targeted at them.

6.2 Adults (Individuals)

The proposed new children and young people's service:

- will be very warmly welcomed, especially by parents, and is believed in some quarters to be long overdue;
- must make high quality programming a priority;
- should reflect contemporary family lifestyles in its approach to scheduling options;
- should make its language policy very clear from the outset, and plan to incorporate suitable programming for the whole continuum of linguistic ability;
- must be strongly and appropriately branded for the three different target audiences, and promoted via suitable platforms for each audience;
- needs to ensure continuity of availability and inclusion on the relevant EPGs.

6.3 Adults (Organisations)

- The proposed new service is seen as a unique opportunity to offer Welsh-speaking children and young people enhanced television services.
- S4C's commitment to providing this service is commended, at a time when many UK broadcasters seem to be backing away from young people's provision.
- The enhanced service is perceived to offer a real opportunity for Welsh production companies.
- Some organisations wish S4C to think about segmenting the target audience in a more sophisticated way than is expressed in the proposals – both in terms of the age breakdown and links with the educational curriculum, and also in terms of linguistic abilities.
- The proposals to pursue multiplatform broadcasting options and to make full and creative use of all available technology are widely welcomed.
- There is, however, a significant number of organisations for whom their basic approval of the enhancement of Welsh language television services for children and young people is tempered by a concern that the S4C proposals as outlined in the consultation document will negatively impact access to television coverage of the National Assembly proceedings. The Authority is therefore urged to look again at the possible capacity options by a number of respondents.
- Responses from a number of organisations and individuals indicate that the Authority needs to demonstrate that its decision not to seek additional funding for the new services at this stage will not have a detrimental effect on the overall S4C output across existing services.

Responses Received

Details of the responses received by the Authority during the consultation process that we have permission to publish are to be found by following the links below.

Responses from Children and Young People

[Responses from Children and Young People](#)

Responses from Individuals

Received via the web

[Responses from Individuals A-H](#)

[Responses from Individuals J-M](#)

[Responses from Individuals N-R](#)

[Responses from Individuals S-W](#)

Received directly

[Responses from Individuals](#)

Responses from Organisations

Received via the web

[Responses from Organisations received via the web](#)

Received directly

[Responses from Organisations received directly](#)

Anonymous Responses

[Anonymous responses](#)